



2021

'Nuove Prospettive sulla Tradizione della "Commedia." Terza Serie (2020).' Martina Cita, Federico Marchetti, and Paolo Trovato, eds. Padua: libreriauniversitaria.it edizioni, 2021.

Paolo Scartoni  
*Rutgers University*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://repository.upenn.edu/bibdant>

 Part of the [Ancient, Medieval, Renaissance and Baroque Art and Architecture Commons](#), [Italian Language and Literature Commons](#), and the [Medieval History Commons](#)

#### Recommended Citation

Scartoni, Paolo (2021) "'Nuove Prospettive sulla Tradizione della "Commedia." Terza Serie (2020).' Martina Cita, Federico Marchetti, and Paolo Trovato, eds. Padua: libreriauniversitaria.it edizioni, 2021.," *Bibliotheca Dantesca: Journal of Dante Studies*: Vol. 4 , Article 17.

Available at: <https://repository.upenn.edu/bibdant/vol4/iss1/17>

This paper is posted at ScholarlyCommons. <https://repository.upenn.edu/bibdant/vol4/iss1/17>  
For more information, please contact [repository@pobox.upenn.edu](mailto:repository@pobox.upenn.edu).

Overall, these two volumes give the reader a great and accurate collection of insights on illustration of Dante's verses in the fifteenth century, blending multiple disciplines and connecting manuscripts and printing.

Stefano Cassini, *Catholic University of Milan*

*Nuove Prospettive sulla Tradizione della "Commedia." Terza Serie (2020).*

Martina Cita, Federico Marchetti, and Paolo Trovato, eds.

Padua: [libreriauniversitaria.it](http://libreriauniversitaria.it) edizioni, 2021. 221 pp. €19.90.

---

As the current issue of *Bibliotheca Dantesca* comes out, the first two volumes (Introduction and *Inferno*) of the new critical edition of Dante's *Comedy*, edited by the so-called *Gruppo di Ferrara*, should already have been or will soon be released. Their publication marks a turning point in the editorial history of the *Comedy*, and in textual philology and criticism in general. Conducted on ca. 630 *loci critici* and more than 580 witnesses, the collation carried out by the *Gruppo di Ferrara*, led by Paolo Trovato, is a truly remarkable endeavor that no Dante scholar nor textual critic will be able to ignore. *Nuove Prospettive* offers us a glimpse into their workshop, shedding light on the problems they faced, as well as on their methodology and some preliminary results.

*Nuove Prospettive* is the proceeding of an online symposium held in June 2020, in which the *Gruppo di Ferrara* confronted a selected group of Dante scholars and philologists in preparation of the new edition of the *Comedy*. The first part of the volume, "Qualche altra idea su Dante," features seven essays presented by the members of the *Gruppo*. The second part, "Note e commenti," is a collection of objections, observations, and further considerations from the discussants invited to the conference.

The essay by Luisa Ferretti Cuomo, who is charge of the new edition's commentary, opens the volume. It is a highly enjoyable, insightful, and informative collection of five case studies that show what the lexicological challenges of glossing the *Comedy* are and what tools should be used to reconstruct the history and meaning of problematic terms. In the following essay, Elisabetta Tonello shares some considerations about the contaminations of the manuscripts belonging to the *periferia stemmatica* ("...the witnesses that cannot be linked to neither big nor small families,"<sup>1</sup> p. 23) of the Tuscan-Florentine tradition of the *Comedy*. Tonello provides detailed tables that summarize her findings. She takes into consideration both contaminations of readings, "when the copyist chooses case by case, line by line, from two or more models simultaneously present on their desk," or contamination of exemplars, "when the models alternate regularly" (p. 25). She also identifies and investigates a third kind of contamination, which she terms "hybrid," that is a

---

<sup>1</sup> All translations are mine.

combination of the other two. Her contribution is of great importance for anyone interested in the slippery topic of contamination.

The following two essays, by Fabio Romanini and Marco Giola, offer some preliminary considerations on the future editions of *Purgatorio* and *Paradiso*, respectively. Romanini looks at the 15 *loci critici* from *Purg.* 2 (8 taken from Barbi, 4 from Petrocchi, and 3 selected by the *Gruppo di Ferrara*, p. 39). The *Gruppo* famously identified the codices of the  $\beta$  branch of the stemma, *Florio* (Udine, Università degli Studi di Udine, Bibl. Florio, 001) and *Urbinate* (Vatican City, Bibl. Apost. Vaticana, Urb. Lat. 366), as two of the most authoritative witnesses of the entire tradition and underscored the close affinity between the two. Not surprisingly, then, Romanini concludes that “also in this canto, the agreement between *Florio* and *Urbinate* is extremely high” (p. 45). He also argues that “the families previously identified are solid” and suggests that they also show striking graphic similarities (p. 45). Giola combines a study of the variants, and of Dante’s previous works and sources to offer an interpretation of 5 case studies (6 *loci critici*) from *Par.* 15. His contribution is useful both in terms of methodology and for his multi-layered approach.

Martina Cita and Elena Niccolai’s contributions are specific to *Inferno* and the authors most likely relied on a critical edition which was at an extremely advanced stage. I believe these essays to be the most interesting of the volume. Cita offers a remarkably clear exposition on the *fiorentinismi* of the family  $\beta$  (U and F in the *stemma ferrarese*), the sub-archetype of reference of the edition. Such an assessment is paramount, for U and F are northern witnesses and their degree of “florentinness” could hypothetically be evidence of authenticity. Niccolai in turn assesses the “new prosody of *Inferno* according to  $\beta$ .” Her essay offers a detailed account of the prosodic features of *Inferno* based on about 20 cantos of the edition (p. 88). Niccolai compares the prosody of  $\beta$ ’s *Inferno* with that of the Sicilian poets, concluding that they are in conversation (p. 127). She also demonstrates how  $\beta$  allows for the drastic reduction in the number of exceptions to the predominant prosodic practices of the text. That I know of, this is the first critical edition whose results are specifically assessed through the verification of prosody, which attests to the intelligence and rigor of the entire operation.

In the last contribution of the first part of the volume, Paolo Trovato shares some reflections on the punctuation of some of the *codices*. Many considerations are fascinating: for instance, the idea that in Triv. (Milano, Bibl. Trivulziana, 1080), the *virgula* might signal words accented on the final syllable and accented monosyllables (p. 133). Nevertheless, what is most striking, especially considering some of the previous essays, are once again the similarities between U and F, which he extends to the archetype  $\beta_0$ . Trovato points out how the punctuation of U is not “less sophisticated than the autograph section of Petrarch’s *Rerum vulgarium fragmenta*,” suggesting that  $\beta_0$  might transmit traces of Dante’s own punctuation practices (pp. 148 ff.).

The second part of the volume gathers the contributions of some of the discussants: Luciano Formisano, Giovanna Frosini, Laura Facini and Arnaldo Soldani, Rosario Coluccia, Sandro Bertelli, Mirko Tavoni, Tiziano Zanato, and Lorenzo Renzi. Their observations contain, more often than not, some critical

objections. And quite frankly, it would be surprising if an operation such as the one carried out by the *Gruppo di Ferrara* had raised no perplexities: they will, after all, restore a version of the *Comedy* (that is, a text that almost every Italian and many international readers know intimately well) to which our ears are not accustomed. This volume is a must read for anyone planning to evaluate their new *Comedy*. It documents the rigor, spirit of collaboration (among the members of the group as well as with the rest of the community of Dante scholars and philologists), and methodological innovations that made the experience of the *Gruppo di Ferrara* the most interesting philological workshop on the *Comedy* in our time.

Paolo Scartoni, *Rutgers University*

*Approaches to Teaching Dante's Divine Comedy*, 2nd edition.

Christopher Kleinhenz and Kristina Olson, eds.

New York, NY: Modern Languages Association of America, 2020. 312 pp. \$65.

---

The 2020 *Approaches to Teaching Dante's Divine Comedy* edited by Kristina Olson and Christopher Kleinhenz at once complements and expands Carol Shade's 1982 edition, detailing major advancements and transformations in the pedagogical practices of American Dante studies over the last three decades. The excellence of the volume lies in the editors' ability as conductors of a symphonic conversation across teaching practices and educational contexts, research backgrounds and scholarly expertise. While Slade's volume stood granitically centered on a "more traditionally focused Dante pedagogy" (p. xii), Kleinhenz and Olson's collection embraces the ever-shifting horizons of the discipline in both teaching and learning, stirred by "new research in material philology, cultural studies and literary theory" (p. xii), digital humanities and creative writing.

The macro-structure of the volume distinguishes between 'Materials' and 'Approaches'. In the former, the editors' annotated bibliography is a comprehensive, highly practical aid to both first- and old-timer instructors. Among the wealth of editions, translations, critical studies and articles, the "Instructor's Library" records the appearance of new, up-and-coming journals (like our very own *Bibliotheca Dantesca*), "two clusters of essays on teaching Dante" in *Pedagogy* as well as detail the expansion of reception studies and multiplication of digital humanities projects. The 2020-publication date robbed the editors' the chance to include the outburst of works of highly-teachable potential launched for the 2021 Centenary such as Laura Ingallinella's Wiki Education project - developed with her students at Wellesley College and retraces and reinscribes the memory of the women featured in the *Comedy*. Or the online exhibition (<https://www.commediadivinaonlineexhibition.com/>) created by the recently established Centre for Dante Studies in Ireland of 'La Commedia Divina' by Liam