Using Integrated Data Systems (IDS) to Design and Support Pay For Success Interventions: Cuyahoga County, Ohio

Francisca García-Cobián Richter
*Case Western Reserve University*

Meghan Salas Atwell
*Case Western Reserve University*

Follow this and additional works at: https://repository.upenn.edu/admindata_conferences_presentations_2018

https://repository.upenn.edu/admindata_conferences_presentations_2018/22

DOI https://doi.org/10.23889/ijpds.v3i5.1080

This paper is posted at ScholarlyCommons. https://repository.upenn.edu/admindata_conferences_presentations_2018/22
For more information, please contact repository@pobox.upenn.edu.
Using Integrated Data Systems (IDS) to Design and Support Pay For Success Interventions: Cuyahoga County, Ohio

Abstract
Pay for Success (PFS) interventions are increasingly being implemented in the U.S. and worldwide to assess social programs under a risk-sharing financial agreement between the public and private sectors. They seek to mitigate risk for the public sector and promote wider experimentation of programs to improve social outcomes. PFS contracts encourage coordination and alignment of goals, outcomes, and metrics across all agents involved - government, service providers, service recipients, funders and investors. Accordingly, these interventions rely heavily on access to high quality data and analysis, making integrated data systems (IDS) valuable assets to support the design, implementation, and evaluation phases of these projects.

The ChildHood Integrated Longitudinal Data (CHILD) System, one of the most comprehensive county-level IDS in the nation, has been used to support and inform two Pay for Success projects in Cuyahoga County (Cleveland). Partnering for Family Success is a county-level intervention in the areas of child welfare and housing instability, now into its fourth year of operation. While the intervention was implemented under a randomized controlled trial, analysis with CHILD proved instrumental to inform the project design and address challenges in program implementation. CHILD has also been used to study the feasibility of PFS as a model to expand high quality preschool, under a grant awarded to eight communities nationally. A case study of both initiatives will be presented, highlighting the role of integrated data in supporting and facilitating PFS design and analysis of outcomes, challenges encountered and lessons learned.

Comments
DOI https://doi.org/10.23889/ijpds.v3i5.1080

This presentation is available at ScholarlyCommons: https://repository.upenn.edu/admindata_conferences_presentations_2018/22
Using Integrated Data Systems (IDS) to Design and Support Pay For Success Interventions: Cuyahoga County, Ohio

Francisca García-Cobián Richter
Meghan Salas Atwell

Center on Urban Poverty and Community Development

November 14, 2018
ADRF Research Conference, Washington, D.C.
Pay For Success: The Overall Approach

HOW PAY FOR SUCCESS WORKS

- Government prioritizes social problem
- Service provider has solution
- Investors provide upfront capital
- Evaluator measures success
- Intermediary manages project
- Government repays investors from savings if results are met*

Test or scale-up interventions to improve social outcomes, reducing risk to government.

- Conditional on **successful outcomes**, government pays investors the contracted amount
- **Independent Evaluator** designs and executes evaluation
- 20 PFS projects launched in U. S. 2012-2017 (Nonprofit Finance Fund)

http://www.policyinnovationlab.org/pfs
What factors guide the pursuit of a PFS Initiative?

- A significant, unmet social need
- A well-defined and measurable target population and outcome
- A promising intervention by service provider with capacity to scale up
- Government leadership displayed at the local/state/federal level
- Demonstration that fiscal savings are available for the government
- Credible administrative data and that is available and timely
- Possibility to implement rigorous evaluation design
- Ability to mitigate risk of project failure for funders/investors

Elements in red call upon IDS
The ChildHood Integrated Longitudinal Data (CHILD) System

- Prenatal care
- Birth characteristics
- Cause of death
- Infant mortality
- Lead levels
- Electronic Medical Records
- Housing condition
- Tax delinquency
- Foreclosure
- Homelessness
- Public Housing residency
- Attendance
- School readiness
- Proficiency test scores
- Disability status
- Graduation test
- Charter Schools
- Ohio Means Jobs
- Unemployment
- Wage records

- Medicaid
- SNAP
- TANF
- Child support enforcement
- Home visiting
- Child care
- UPK
- Special needs child care
- Early childhood mental health
- Abuse/neglect reports
- Out of home placements
- Juvenile court
- Jail involvement

Italics = In progress of obtaining
CHILD informs design and implementation of
High Quality Preschool PFS Feasibility Study

• DOE funded 8 communities 2017-2019
• **Target Population:** Children aged 3-5 in Cuyahoga County
• **Target Outcomes:** Kindergarten readiness, on-time matriculation, chronic absenteeism, social emotional development
• **Intervention:** High Quality Preschool – County UPK program
• **Evaluation:** Longitudinal retrospective cohort analysis comparing children attending UPK to those attending other settings.

**GOALS of the Feasibility Study:**
1. Explore the viability of using outcomes contracting to *sustain and expand the* universal prekindergarten (UPK) and *improve early education outcomes* in Cuyahoga County
2. **Identify potential outcome measures** that demonstrate student success, resulting in economic/social benefits to outcome payers and general benefits to the community
3. **Integrate data** systems to examine the impact of UPK
4. Discuss terms of potential project with **potential outcome payer(s)**
5. Identify and **engage local private investors** to leverage funds for outcomes-oriented pre-kindergarten services expansion
6. Examine **service provider and workforce capacity** for further expansion of the UPK program
Partnering for Family Success
First county-level PFS initiative (2015-2020)

- What characterizes families with long times in foster care?
- **Target population**: Families with housing instability and children in foster care, 2015-2017.
- **Target Outcome**: 25% Reduction in foster care days by end of 2019.
- **Intervention**: Rapid Rehousing; Critical Time Intervention; Trauma Focused Cognitive Behavioral Therapy
- **Evaluation**: RCT
CHILD informs design and implementation of Partnering for Family Success

**Planning**
- Identify/quantify target population
  - 2010 DCFS cohort

**Implementation**
- $75/day-child in foster care
  - Small target population - potential to deliver sizable savings
- Adjust/expand definition of housing instability

**Evaluation**
- Domestic Violence more prevalent among randomized treatment group
- Statistical model of impact beyond reduction in foster care days

---

![Histogram showing total days in foster care](attachment:image.png)

Legend:
- w/o hmls event
- perm. custody
- with hmls event
Lessons Learned

High Quality Preschool

• PFS can encourage data sharing.

• Measureable and strong outcomes alone are not sufficient for a PFS initiative to be deemed “feasible”

• When direct benefits (short and long-term) are diffuse and accrue across multiple stakeholders, structuring outcome payment is a challenge.

Partnering for Family Success

• Persistent influence of individual and contextual factors in housing stability

• Need flexibility to deliver rigorous evaluation.

• IDS can track long term outcomes beyond metric tied to payments.

• Rigorous methods, tracking enhances ability to learn from other PFS interventions.
Thank you!

Q / A

Contact Information
• Francisca García-Cobián Richter, Ph.D (fxr58@case.edu)
• Meghan Salas Atwell, Ph.D (mas486@case.edu)

Resources
• Center on Urban Poverty & Community Development: http://povertycenter.case.edu/
School District Data Holdings

Before Grant
School District Data Holdings

After Grant