2016

“Doin’ It Up Right”: Safeguarding the African-American Burial Landscape Through the Lens of Eden Cemetery

Charlette Caldwell
University of Pennsylvania

Follow this and additional works at: http://repository.upenn.edu/hp_theses

Part of the Historic Preservation and Conservation Commons, and the Landscape Architecture Commons

http://repository.upenn.edu/hp_theses/613

Suggested Citation:

This paper is posted at ScholarlyCommons. http://repository.upenn.edu/hp_theses/613
For more information, please contact repository@pobox.upenn.edu.
“Doin’ It Up Right”: Safeguarding the African-American Burial Landscape Through the Lens of Eden Cemetery

Abstract
This thesis involved researching the significance of African-American burial sites, how and why they were and continue to be created. The legacy of these types correlate to the formation of Eden Cemetery. I researched existing scholarship on the subject of African-American burial sites, cultural factors driving these types, and the history of Eden Cemetery to gain insight into the history of the black community’s responses to burial site relocation in Philadelphia. I discovered that Eden derives its significance from being the only available place for condemned black sites in Philadelphia in the beginning of the twentieth century due to the efforts of those who continued the legacy of establishing a burial place of respect for blacks that was seen in condemned sites such as Lebanon Cemetery and Olive Cemetery, black churchyards, and as well as petitioning to section off the black-only sections of Philadelphia’s potter’s fields. The result formed the beginnings of cultural landscape report that could be used to analyze and interpret other black burial sites that are part of the larger history of cultural and political factors that affect African-American burial history. Also, highlighting issues present at Eden (maintenance and lack of a complete historical record) in tandem with the research done on the evolution of black burial sites could provide an opportunity to gain more public attention for Eden. This could prove useful in efforts to amend Eden’s 2010 National Register of Historic Places Register Nomination and apply the cemetery for National Historic Landmark status.

Keywords
ethnographic landscape, condemned burial sites, lawn-park cemeteries, cultural landscapes, types of African-American burial sites

Disciplines
Historic Preservation and Conservation | Landscape Architecture

Comments
Suggested Citation:

This thesis or dissertation is available at ScholarlyCommons: http://repositoryupenn.edu/hp_theses/613
"DOIN’ IT UP RIGHT": SAFEGUARDING AFRICAN-AMERICAN BURIAL LANDSCAPES THROUGH THE LENS OF EDEN CEMETERY

Charlette Michelle Caldwell

A THESIS

in

Historic Preservation

Presented to the Faculties of the University of Pennsylvania in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements of the Degree of

MASTER OF SCIENCE IN HISTORIC PRESERVATION

2016

____________________________
Advisor
Aaron V. Wunsch
Assistant Professor

____________________________
Program Chair
Randall F. Mason
Associate Professor
To Zorja, Cody, my father, my mother, and my sister, Cana.
Acknowledgements

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to the Eden Cemetery Company, in particular, Sheila Jones, whose previous efforts researching and documenting the history of Eden made my thesis possible. I also wanted to express my appreciation for her willingness to read through numerous drafts of this thesis and offer advice and guidance on evaluating Eden’s significance. To Mina Cockroft, the cemetery manager, who was extremely helpful to me the first day I visited Eden and the many visits after. Also I would like to thank Mina for driving me home after a long visit to Eden. And to my thesis advisor, Aaron Wunsch, who diligently supported my research efforts on African-American burial sites, as well as renewing my appreciation of the legacy of this type of material culture, as well as the legacy of my own personal experiences.

I also would like to give special thanks to Heather Schumacher at the University of Pennsylvania Architecture Archives, who transcribed the Eden Company Charter, Douglass Mooney and the work of those who began documenting African-American burial sites in Philadelphia, the Eden Cemetery Staff, especially those who helped me to locate graves and headstones on site, and to my family, and my friends, who have been extremely supportive during this very rewarding endeavor.
# Table of Content

Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................ iii
List of Figures.................................................................................................................... v
Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 1
Chapter One: History of the Formation of African-American Burial Sites and Evolving Attitudes Towards Death ................................................................................. 5
Chapter Two: Types of African-American Burial Sites ..................................................... 15
Chapter Three: Eden Cemetery, a Twentieth-Century Suburban Cemetery ...................... 24
Chapter Four: Cultural Landscape Management Plan for Eden Cemetery ......................... 41
Conclusion ......................................................................................................................... 55
Bibliography ..................................................................................................................... 60
Appendix 1 Figures.............................................................................................................. 68
Appendix 2 Maps of African-American Burial Site Displacement in Philadelphia .............. 214
Index................................................................................................................................... 222
List of Figures

1. A small cemetery for African slaves and free black New Yorkers developed along the southern edge of Collect Pond. Source: Preserve America.


5. View of the entrance to Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.


8. Uncut rock gravestones in a graveyard used exclusively by African-American sharecroppers, Person County, North Carolina. Photo Credit: Dorothea Lange.

9. View of the Woodlands Cemetery in Philadelphia, established in 1840. The Woodlands represents the “traditional” organization of the European-American burial landscape that would not be seen in African-American burial sites until the formation of rural cemeteries such as Lebanon and Olive Cemeteries in 1849. Also the Woodlands is an excellent example of a rural cemetery, which juxtaposes Eden’s lawn-park cemetery design. Photo Credit: Author.
10 1862 Smedley map of Olive Cemetery and the cemetery attached to the Catholic Church Our Mother of Sorrows (labeled in this map as Cathedral Cemetery). Although Our Mother of Sorrows’ present congregation is predominantly African-American, in the nineteenth century the church served a mostly Irish population. This map is meant to show the separation in burial between blacks and whites. Olive was one of the only places blacks were allowed burial services in Philadelphia at this time. Source: Samuel L. Smedley Map, Phil Geo History.

11 A funeral procession in Monroe, Georgia, for George Dorsey and Dorothey Dorsey Malcolm, who were lynched in 1946. Source: Bettmann/CORBIS.

12 Map of the Seventh Ward of Philadelphia, 1899. “W.E.B. Du Bois conducted his pioneering sociological study, The Philadelphia Negro, in the Seventh Ward, which was bounded by Spruce Street on the north, South Street on the south, Sixth Street on the east, and Twenty-Third Street on the west. At that time, the Seventh Ward contained the largest population of Blacks in the city of Philadelphia. This map was published as part of the study”. Source: The University of Pennsylvania Archives.


16 The Maerschalk plan of the City of New York is a historic map made in 1754 that clearly shows the African Burial Ground and its surrounding neighborhood. Source: National Park Service.

A jazz funeral procession for a deceased musician in New Orleans, Louisiana, circa 1965.
The marching band traditionally plays slow dirges on the journey to the cemetery and upbeat melodies on the way back. Photo Credit: FPG/Archive Photos/Getty Images.


1895 Map of Lebanon Cemetery. Source: Sanborn.

1895 Map of Olive Cemetery. Source: Sanborn.

Map of the Borough of Collingdale. Although Mount Lebanon Cemetery is not shown on this map, it is a part of Collingdale which has been confirmed by numerous reports. Prepared by Pennsylvania Department of Transportation, Bureau of Planning and Research Geographic Information Division, 2010.

Map of the Borough of Collingdale. This map accurately shows Mount Lebanon located in the Borough of Collingdale. Source: Mapwrapper, 2016.

Map of Darby Borough (Collingdale) 1892 The Bartram family farm owned by Thomas and Isaac are is located between Springfield Road and Bartram Avenue next to Mount Zion. Source: Sanborn.

Map of Land owned by Thomas Bartram before Eden purchase, 1892. Source: Philly Geo History.
27 Map of Merion Cemetery in Bala Cynwyd, PA. Source: Philly Geo History.


29 “A Startling Query: President Asbury Wants to Know if Collingdale Wants Dead Niggers or Live Ones.” Source: Delaware County Daily Times, August 22, 1902.

30 Photo of Celestine Cromwell’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.

31 Photo of John C. Asbury’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.

32 Photo of Jerome Bacon’s grave. No headstone was dedicated to this grave. Photo Credit: Author.

33 Photo of Charles W. Jones’ cenotaph. Photo Credit: Author.

34 Photo of Martin J. Lehmann’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.

35 Photo of Daniel W. Parvis’ headstone. Photo Credit: Author.


37 Part of Boros. Of Darby Collingdale and Sharon Hill, 1929. Source: Philly Geo History.

38 Part of Ridley and Darby Twps. Aldan, Collingdale, and Glenolden, 1929. Source: Philly Geo History.


40 “Perpetually Enshrined: Every man should give serious thought to the important duty of choosing a final resting place for departed loved ones.” Source: The Philadelphia Tribune, Thursday, March 19th, 1931.

41 View of the current perimeter conditions at Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.

42 View of the current perimeter conditions at Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.

43 View of the administrative building from the Celestine Section. Photo Credit: Author.

44 View of the administrative building from the Katherine Parvis Gardens Section. Photo Credit: Author.
View of the administrative building from the Lincoln Section. Photo Credit: Author.

View of the administrative building from the Douglass D Section. Photo Credit: Author.


Bench by the Road memorial. The Bench by the Road Project is a memorial history and community outreach initiative of the Toni Morrison Society. The goal of the project is “to create an outdoor museum that will mark important locations in African-American history both in the United States and abroad.” (Toni Morrison Society) Eden ’s bench is the eleventh bench placed by this organization. Photo Credit: Author

Bench by the Road memorial plaque. Photo Credit: Author.

Image of Catto “A” Lot Board. These are scanned images of the original lot boards used by the Eden Cemetery Company to keep track of the lots. According to Sheila Jones, there are a few mistakes that need to be corrected on these boards including the orientation of the lots and landscape features. Missing from this sequence are lot boards for the Douglass “A”, “B”, Daniel Parvis, Celestine Reserve, and Katherine Parvis Gardens Sections. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.


Image of Tubman Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.

Image of Bowers Lot Board. Note that Bowers is spelled incorrectly. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.

Image of Lebanon Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.


Image of Lincoln Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.

Image of Home Lot Board. Note that there is no round about path through Home as indicated. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.


View of the original gate posts from Lebanon Cemetery that have been disturbed and vandalized. According to Aaron Wunsch, the posts may have been the original entrance to Eden when Bartram Avenue was a major road between Mount Zion and Eden. Photo Credit: Author.

Photo of disturbed headstones in Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.

Photo of disturbed headstones in Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.

Photo of disturbed headstones in Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.

Photo of disturbed headstones in Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.

Photo of disturbed headstones in Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.


Photo of the Catto A Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.

Photo of the Catto A Section. Photo Credit: Author.

Photo of the Catto B Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.

Photo of Catto B Section. Photo Credit: Author.

Photo Catto’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.

Photo of the David Bowser Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.

Photo of the David Bowser Section. Photo Credit: Author.
80 Photo of the Lehmann Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
81 Photo of the Lehman Section. Photo Credit: Author.
82 Photo of Julian Abele ’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
83 Photo of the Richard Allen Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
84 Photo of the Richard Allen Section. Photo Credit: Author.
85 Photo of Arizona Cleaver Stemmons’ headstone (Front). Photo Credit: Author.
86 Photo of Arizona Cleaver Stemmons’ headstone (Back). Photo Credit: Author.
87 Photo of the Tubman Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
88 Photo of the Tubman Section. Photo Credit: Author.
89 Photo of Robert Penn ’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
90 Photo of the Bowers Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author. Note that Bowers is spelled incorrectly.
91 Photo of the Bowers Section from the creek. Photo Credit: Author.
92 Photo of the Lebanon Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
93 Photo of the Lebanon Section. Photo Credit: Author.
94 Photo of William Still ’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
95 Photo of Absalom Jones’ cenotaph. Photo Credit: Author.
96 Photo of Elizabeth and Hiram Montier ’s grave. Photo Credit: Author.
97 Photo of the Letson-Martin Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
98 Photo of the Letson-Martin Section. Photo Credit: Author.
99 Photo of the John Brown Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
100 Photo of the John Brown Section. Photo Credit: Author.
101 Photo of Frances Ellen Watkins Harper ’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
102 Photo of the Douglass “A” Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
103 Photo of the Douglass “A” section. Photo Credit: Author.
104  Photo of the Douglass “B” Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
105  Photo of the Douglass “B” Section. Photo Credit: Author.
106  Photo of the Douglass “C” Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
107  Photo of the Douglass “C” Section. Photo Credit: Author.
108  Photo of the Douglass “D” Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
110  Photo of the Douglass “E” Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
111  Photo of the Douglass “E” Section. Photo Credit: Author.
112  Photo of Tyrone Everett’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
113  Photo of the Daniel Parvis Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
114  Photo of the Daniel Parvis Section. Photo Credit: Author.
115  Photo of the Lincoln Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
116  Photo of the Lincoln Section. Photo Credit: Author.
117  Photo of the Home Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
118  Photo of the Home Section. Photo Credit: Author.
119  Photo of Stephen Smith’s headstone. Stephen Smith is buried in Celestine. Photo Credit: Author.
120  Photo of the Olive Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
121  Photo of the Olive Section. Photo Credit: Author.
122  Photo of the Celestine Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
123  Photo of the Celestine Section. Photo Credit: Author.
124  Photo of the Celestine Reserve #1 Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
125  Photo of the Celestine Reserve #1 Section. Photo Credit: Author.
126  Photo of the Celestine Reserve #2 Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
127  Photo of the Celestine Reserve #2 Section. Photo Credit: Author.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>128</td>
<td>Photo of Reginald Bryant ’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>129</td>
<td>Photo of George Henry White’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130</td>
<td>Photo of Charles Tindley ’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>131</td>
<td>Photo of Christopher Perry ’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>132</td>
<td>Photo of Marian Anderson ’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>133</td>
<td>Photo of the Katherine Parvis Gardens Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>134</td>
<td>Photo of the Katherine Parvis Gardens Section. Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>135</td>
<td>View of the creek in between Richard Allen and Bowers Sections (Close-up). Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>136</td>
<td>View of the creek next to Bowers Sections. Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>137</td>
<td>View of creek by the Letson-Martin Section. Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>138</td>
<td>View of creek next the Letson-Martin Section (Mouth). Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>139</td>
<td>View of creek next to Letson-Martin Section (Side). Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>140</td>
<td>View of the receiving vault (From the main path). Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>141</td>
<td>View of the receiving vault (Front). Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>142</td>
<td>View of the receiving vault (Side next to John Brown Section). Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>143</td>
<td>View of the receiving vault door. Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>144</td>
<td>Interior of the receiving vault. Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>145</td>
<td>1919 Monument to African-American soldiers who served during World War 1, located next to the gate entrance, in front of the Katherine Parvis Gardens Section. The inscription on the monument reads: “In memoriam, the colored soldiers of Pennsylvania who fought and died in France 1917-1918 that Liberty, Equality, and Fraternity might be established between all nations and among all peoples. Erected by the memorial committee May 30th, 1919. Photo Credit: Author.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

African-American burial landscapes are not isolated phenomena. They are responses to outside forces that have been shaped by African-American culture. African-American burial landscapes are made up of more than one universal type. These specific types of burial sites should be defined as sub-cultural landscapes in and of themselves1: mappable cultural repositories that are collection sites of major aspects of African-American culture such as politics, religion, and even landscape architecture. Although scholarship exists on the different types of African-American burial landscapes, little is known about these sites’ period-specificity, which has been the result of displacement, religion, and racial politics. According to some scholars, such as Ronald Barrett, James L. Moore III, and Clifton D. Bryant, coping with the reality of death, to African-Americans, is a constant struggle, but also a source of freedom. According to African-Americans, death is the “second great event of life” and the way “in which you go out is important, very important.”2 This mantra is the basis for the well-used phrase in the African-American community: “doin’ it up right”, in which every event of life is a reason to dress up and “show out”.3 Within this context, even the act of burial becomes a well-orchestrated celebration of life, rather than a period of mourning; burial becomes an act of sending the beloved “home” properly with veneration. Our methods for preserving African-American burial landscapes should follow this concept: a preservation approach that not only recognizes the significance of these burial sites, but also celebrates them immensely. A standard preservation approach should take into consideration the cultural, historical, and social

1 Richard V. Francaviglia, “The Cemetery as an Evolving Cultural Landscape,” *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 61, no. 3 (September 1971), 501. In this definition of total landscapes, it refers to the incorporation of both spatial and architectural elements.
3 A phrase that has also been used in the African-American community to describe over the top behavior and celebration.
elements of African-American heritage. It should coherently retell how the importance of this legacy is the most satisfactory manner of protecting this particularly vulnerable form of material culture.

African-American culture, although diverse, is an integral part of a shared American heritage. By studying the geography of African-American burial landscapes as a source of accessible material culture, one could start to use these burial sites as a lens to appreciate the larger context of American burial history. African-American burial landscapes, which have rarely been understood beyond slave burial sites and recently churchyards, are uniquely diverse as well; they have adapted to discrimination African-Americans have faced due to restrictions set on where and how their dead are buried. The extensiveness of the history of African-American burial landscapes represents a wide thematic narrative which runs parallel to African-American history from the slave era to the present. Due to the length of time and evolution in the culture, it is important that African-American burial landscapes be broken down into period-specific types. The types that have been identified are slave graveyards (Fig. 01), black-only sections of potter’s fields before and after the American Civil War (Fig. 02), post-1865 churchyards (Fig. 03), late nineteenth-century nonsectarian segregated rural cemeteries (Fig. 04), and early twentieth-century suburban cemeteries (Fig 05). The last type mentioned is crucial in analyzing African-American burial history because these are still intact, which is rare for most African-American burial sites established before the twentieth century. This thesis analyzes this specific African-American burial landscape type by using Eden Cemetery in Collingdale, Pennsylvania, as a case study (Fig. 06 - 07). Eden Cemetery is a repository of cultural and physical features of a long tradition of African-American burial practices and the evolving geography of African-American burial sites in Philadelphia.

**Methodology.**

My methodological approach to creating this thesis’s proposed preservation plan for Eden and its African-American burial legacy began with a literature review, historical research, and analysis
of academic and field work focused on African-American culture, the evolution of American burial sites, and African-American burial site types. From the research, I selected Eden Cemetery as the prominent case study, due to the fact that it was still intact and it being the “collector site” of displaced nineteenth-century African-American burial sites originally located in or close to the urban center of Philadelphia. I supplemented research with other examples of African-American burial sites, such as graveyards, churchyards, and cemeteries in Philadelphia. I conducted site visits to Eden in order to visually survey the cemetery, which included interviews with Sheila Jones, a longtime volunteer at Eden, and community partners. These site visits helped to assess the values attributed to Eden and how professionals and the community could use an historical and management report as an educational tool. A value-based approach (in which heritage sites are interpreted according to social and cultural principles a community attributes to the site) to preserving the cemetery’s cultural repository begins with stating the significance of the site, analyzing the values, and how to evaluate and manage the cemetery’s potential for changing over time. This provided the basis for defining Eden as a valuable example of the twentieth-century African-American suburban cemetery: a focus point used to analyze and interpret the social and cultural values of African-American history, which will result in a practical plan that educates people about this aspect of African-American burial landscapes.

**Literature Review.**

A desire to understand African-American burial sites in broad historical and cultural context led me to the literature on key aspects of African-American culture and history. From this, I narrowed my research to look at the foundation of African-American burial customs and African-American burial responses to movement, in particular displacement, religion, and politics. The second half of the literature review focused on Eden Cemetery and its historical narrative as well as the cultural values attributed to it from the local community. Finally, due to specific interests in
cultural landscape thinking, topics of how to read the cemetery cultural landscape were also included. For future research on the subject, this thesis’s bibliography is divided in the six categories: African-American culture, American burial sites, African-American burial customs, urban and rural African-American burial sites, topics in cemetery cultural landscape thinking, and Eden Cemetery sources, including documents and maps used to reconstruct Eden’s history and significance.

**Research on Eden Cemetery.**

Much of this thesis is focused on Eden Cemetery and its position within the history of African-American burial landscapes in Philadelphia. Eden Cemetery is a collection site of African-American displacement and abandonment in American burial history. As the final resting place for cemeteries and churchyards condemned in Philadelphia during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the founders of Eden sought to reconcile the narrative of displacement in the African-American community with a solution that unified people and offered them a place of respect and dignity that had not been accessible in other facets of life. Eden contains the cultural and familial connections between the living, the dead, and the unborn; it is a landscape of influential African-American burial culture. This can be seen in the cemetery sections which have been named after condemned cemeteries, famous African-Americans, and non-African-Americans, important to African-American history, and those who had a part in Eden’s creation. Eden is not only about the legacy of the cultural elite, but also the legacies of “ordinary” African-Americans who are buried equally next to freedom fighters, architects, and musicians. Eden is not the largest African-American cemetery, but its significance lies in the culmination of a repository of culture and the final resting place for graves that would have been lost to history if not for the efforts of influential African-Americans concerned with adequate burial services and the rampant abandonment of black burial sites, and no clear choices to solve the issue. It is important to note that this significance extends
beyond the date of the first burial in Eden back to the slave burial sites and black-only sections of the potter’s fields as well as the efforts of those to create a respected place of burial.

**Preservation Plan and Other Possible Outcomes.**

According to Francaviglia, burial sites are “microcosm[s] of the real world, and bind a particular generation of men to the architectural and perhaps even spatial preferences and prejudices that accompanied them throughout life.” Burial sites are the symbolic representation of a community and the way in which these symbolisms are portrayed is crucial to the generations they represent. In order to conceive a justifiable preservation framework for safeguarding African-American burial landscapes, displacement, religion, and racial politics must be scrutinized. Eden Cemetery represents a larger socio-cultural context which informs and transforms this site through place-making. Eden Cemetery also embodies the lawn-park cemetery movement in that it represents African-Americans adopting open park, suburban cemetery design elements, while representing a sense of “blackness” seen in its section plots. A concrete example of the preservation of Eden’s intangible heritage will come in the form of basic cultural landscapes report, which would provide the cemetery company not only a linear history of the cemetery, but also tools to manage the cultural significance of Eden.

**Chapter One: History of the Formation of African-American Burial Sites and Evolving Attitudes Towards Death**

The evolution of African-American burial landscapes is intrinsically tied to the historical narrative of African-Americans. Although African-American burial history is a subset of American burial history, differences before the twentieth century in African-American burial customs compared to European-American burial customs are significant enough to detect in both investigated

---

4 Francaviglia, 501.
burial practices and burial landscape design and/or organization. The “ideology” behind the patterns of burial between pre-Modern⁵ African-American burial sites and European-American burial sites is “fundamentally” different.⁶ Since many of these earlier African-American burial sites did not resemble European-American burial sites in terms of design, they appear to be either “abandoned” or “disorganized” during contemporary archaeological investigations (Fig. 08 - 09). Pre-1865 slave graveyards and post-1865 potter’s fields did not have “traditional”, meaning European-American inspired, headstone markers or any visible form of “standard” grave organization, which would be seen in later non-sectarian African-American cemeteries at the end of the nineteenth-century and early twentieth-century.⁷ This difference is greatly influenced by the way African-American culture developed, especially after the American Civil War, which could be defined as a specific type of creolization. In Romberg’s research on the term, “creolization means more than just mixture; it involves the creation of new cultures.”⁸ Current African-American burial customs are a mixture of West-African traditions integrated with European-American traditions. This “mixture” allowed African-Americans to assimilate into American burial culture in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. In that respect, the African-American experience can be best described as more “heterogeneous than homogeneous”;⁹ it expresses values that could be arguably included in a wider shared heritage of American burial customs. This creolization is the manifestation of “black consciousness”, the origin of why and where African-Americans have been forced or have chosen to bury their dead.¹⁰ As will be discussed later in this chapter, African-American burial sites, especially

---

⁵ Pre-modern period corresponding to before the American Civil War and from the mid-1800s to the 1900s, where African-Americans were establishing separate rural cemeteries similar to their European-American counterparts.


⁷ Lynn Rainville, “Protecting Our Shared Heritage in African-American Cemeteries,” Journal of Field Archaeology 34, no. 2 (Summer 2009): 196-206. For slave gravestones, the inscriptions would either be completely absent due to illiteracy or the slave master would erect a stone for their slave. These markers would contain subject matter considered “racist” by today’s standards. The stones erected by the masters were also sometimes used to only exhibit the wealth of the owner.


¹⁰ Some scholars have chosen to label African-American West African heritage as a form of “Africanism”. Africanisms are a body of knowledge “often passed down from the oldest living member of the community…encompassing expressions, sayings, and superstitions [that] relate to music, dance, religious beliefs and practice, and the arts.” Barrett, 21.
existing slave graveyards, have been shaped by two major factors: the “persistence” of the West-African perspective on dying, death, and “overtones” of Christian doctrine. Although African and Christian religious attitudes have been historically at odds, these beliefs have resulted in “blended” African-American religious practices and a distinctive outlook on death and dying.\(^{11}\) Eden cemetery’s existence is based on this fusion of beliefs representing how the black community after 1849, the establishment date of Philadelphia’s first rural African-American cemeteries, Lebanon Cemetery and Olive Cemetery, integrated European-American traditions of burial with traditions sustain from the slave graveyards and potter’s fields.

Ethnicity involves the way in which an ethnic group responds to outside forces. Cultural traits are symbolic markers of an ethnic group, and to be effective “these signs and symbols must exist in opposition or contrast to the larger society to define a sense of ‘other’.”\(^{12}\) These cultural traits for African-Americans began with the institution of slavery, sparking debates regarding whether or not African-American culture is a result of creolization or a direct copy of European traditions. The two main points of the Herskovits-Frazier Debate suggest that a) African customs had been carried over into African-American traditions and there is a visible continuity from West Africa to the present that can be witnessed in different facets of culture, such as burial customs, or b) African history and identity had been completely wiped away from the effects of slavery and the result is an African-American culture that has purely imitated European-American traditions.\(^{13}\) Contemporary scholarship generally agrees with the first theory of African-American culture with different variations on the origins of African heritage and the assimilation of African-Americans into


\(^{13}\) McCarthy.
American culture.\textsuperscript{14} Scholars also agree on the level of death that is inherent to the African-American experience. Holloway notes in \textit{Passed On} the concept of death in the African-American experience:

Black folk died in mournful collectives and in disconcerting circumstances. We died in riots and rebellions, as victims of lynching, from executions, murders, police violence, suicides, and untreated or undertreated diseases. In such deaths, being black selected the victim into a macabre fraternity. Certainly, there were innumerable personal stories and discrete situations, both noble and ignoble. But, collectively, the story of how we died shaped a tragic community narrative.\textsuperscript{15}

The African-American experience with death, forged in slavery and cemented in the nineteenth century, focused on moving toward the next phase of life, a “spiritual movement,” in which death is accepted and not feared.\textsuperscript{16}

African-American culture and its experience with death can subdivided into three distinct categories: a) movement, physical and figurative, b) religion, c) and racial politics. Movement in the African-American experience traces the origins from slave trade in West Africa, to the concentration of most of the African-American population in the South before the Civil War, and to the Great Migration to the North during the first half of the twentieth century.\textsuperscript{17} This historical movement developed the culture of African-Americans as the group adapted African heritage to the emerging American culture.\textsuperscript{18} This adaptation could be described as a cultural movement which manifested

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{14} For more information on the subject of the Herskovits-Frazier Debate and the evolution of African-American culture, see Melville Jean Herskovits’ \textit{The Myth of the Negro Past} (Boston: Beacon Press, 1941, 1990). Herskovits develops further the concept of the creolization of African-American culture by describing it as a distinct identity formed from the integration of cultures and people from three continents, Africa, Latin America, and the United States.
\item \textsuperscript{17} Considering the concentration of most African-Americans in the South, traditional southern values and lifestyles play a significant part in the African-American experience: “the southern lifestyle is typically traditional and Afro-centric with distinctive elements of soul (An aspect of African-American culture that has elements of Western culture, but is accentuated by African influences) observable in music, foods, family and relational styles, practices of religion and worship, and so forth.” Barrett, 81, 84.
\item \textsuperscript{18} Barrett goes into depth further about the care of the sick and dying in Africa as well as African-American culture. Death acceptance is a community activity showing an interconnectedness between the living and the dead. He also makes stark differences between African cultures and Western cultures: Western cultures are typically seen as “death-denying” and are
\end{itemize}
itself in the arts (music and literature in particular), religion, and burial practices. Movement is also seen literally in the segregation of black burial sites from the majority, which was present in cities, towns, military forts, etc. (Fig. 10). Eden Cemetery is an example of a repository of burial site movement, unifying displacement, in which bodies were reinterred from abandoned black cemeteries and churchyards. Movement is also a form of celebration during an African-American funeral service. The funeral is a time of joy and celebration and is treated as a typical church service. Each service is unique, but recurring aspects of movement include a procession accompanied with music to the grave site, dancing and singing, as well as dramatic displays of grief, called “keening”, at the wake.

The African-American funeral is an element of another integral part of the ethnic group’s culture: religion. Although the integration of religion with burial sites is not strictly unique to African-American culture, especially considering the importance of “funeralization” and the development of Christianity for European-Americans with the rural cemetery movement in the United States in the nineteenth century, African-American religious practices represents a distinctive story of unification, continuing survival, and community relationships, especially in burial. The black church in the post-slavery era, served as not only the center of religious devotion, but as the place where people met for educational purposes, recreation, and meeting halls. Considering the hardships associated with African-American history, research should include studying the development of black religion in order to completely understand the African-American psyche. Religion, a source of freedom to African-Americans, symbolized the “absence of any restraint”,

---

not as open about the possibility of death since the experience with death was not as extreme as with the African and African-American experience.
allowing one to continue to be responsible to their God in their own way.\textsuperscript{21} The creation of the African Methodist Episcopal (A.M.E) Church founded by Richard Allen on July 17\textsuperscript{th}, 1794 and the African Episcopal Church of St. Thomas founded by Absalom Jones on July 29\textsuperscript{th}, 1794 both “originated as a protest against inhumane treatments” of the black parishioners as well serving for the impetus of the Free African Society, a prominent institution that provided basic services for the black community.\textsuperscript{22} This separation represents cultural and social differences in racial tension and African-American gravitation toward religion as a source of salvation away from discrimination. The Black Church,\textsuperscript{23} not only in Philadelphia, but also elsewhere in the United States, became the signifier for two themes inherent in Black religion: sadness and triumph over death.\textsuperscript{24} Religion is a great predictor of a person’s “attitude, beliefs, and values.”\textsuperscript{25} Following this mold, the Black Funeral has become, from the era of slavery, a “universal set of social activities that serve to accentuate the transformation of the living to the dead – the ultimate rites of passage.”\textsuperscript{26} The church-service funeral has evolved from the seventeenth century to the present into a celebration of the deceased’s life and their freedom from discrimination by “going home” to their heavenly father (Fig. 11).\textsuperscript{27} In the Black Church, the image most conveyed is that of the preacher and parishioners “engaged in dramatic and performative display, speech, and song.”\textsuperscript{28} The theatrical atmosphere is composed of carefully crafted events draped in an air of revelry and praise. This demonstrates the attention to details in burying practices among the African-American community: “doin’ it up right” or sending the deceased off


\textsuperscript{22} Keith Rawlings, \textit{Gone, but Not Forgotten: Quinette Cemetery, a Slave Burial Ground, Established 1866} (Kirkwood: Youth in Action, 2003), 49.

\textsuperscript{23} In socioecological studies of African-American culture and history, the Black Church is a “theological shorthand reference to the pluralism of black Christian churches in the United States.” Lincoln and Mamiya, 1.

\textsuperscript{24} Moore and Bryant.

\textsuperscript{25} In Barrett’s article, these attitudes respond to three influences: 1) “the type of religious experience and denomination,” 2) “the age at which religious conversion occurs,” 3) “the extent of religious practice and internalization of belief,” and 4) “the degree of religious socialization within the family and supporting community.” The earlier the exposure to the religious experience, the more of an impact it will have on the individual and this also applies to the level of conservatism in the religion. Barrett, 81–82.

\textsuperscript{26} Moore and Bryant, 599.

\textsuperscript{27} Ibid., 598.

\textsuperscript{28} Mamiya and Lincoln, 152.
well and in style. Hatcher writes in *John Jasper: The Unmatched Negro Philosopher and Preacher* on the black funeral as fundamentally tied to performance and theatrics:

> From an enslaved man born around 1820: “A negro funeral without an uproar, without shouts and groans, without fainting women and shouting men, without pictures of triumphant deathbeds and the judgement day, and without the gates of heaven wide open and the subjects of the funeral dressed in white and rejoicing around the throne of the Lamb, was no funeral at all.”

The founding of the Philadelphia Black Church by Allen and Jones, religion in general, and African-American history of movement provides a basis for another important piece in African-American cultural values: politics. To DuBois, the problem of the twentieth century was “the problem of the color line,” which culminated in the foundation of Eden as a final resting place responding to racial politics, as well as issues of city growth in Philadelphia, leading to the closing of African-American cemeteries and a few African-American churchyards. Racism percolated through the “metropoles and necropoles” of African-American society creating a visible separation between burial site geography, values, and design. Racial politics led to the mass migration of people to the North and the continued discrimination well into the present. Kalish and Reynolds suggest that to comprehend the African-American psyche and its relationship with death, one must understand the level of violence and discrimination associated with racial politics in African-American history. The invisible chains of racism are a direct result of African-Americans constantly dealing with death and violence, and the solution to this problem has come in the form of creating separate sacred places where African-Americans live and die with dignity. Another main issue related to African-American

---

29 Moore and Bryant, 598.
30 Hatcher, 37.
historic racial politics is segregation, either *de jure*, sanctioned by law, or *de facto*, non-sanctioned, meaning self-segregation. Until the twentieth-century, most burial site segregation was the result of *de jure* segregation, however it is important to note the self-segregation of the African-American community, after the abolition of slavery, in everyday activities to completely understand American racial political history. African-Americans migrated to communities filled with other African-Americans and there they had access to churches and businesses which were either owned by African-Americans, hired them, or promoted civil rights. The segregated community then created its own set of practices and architecture, which included the way they buried their deceased (Fig. 12).

Considering the impact that the institution of slavery had on the record keeping of African-American history, burial sites serve as significant sources of “historical footprints,” representing burial customs that have been the response to cultural factors of African-American history. As part of the conceptual framework for understanding the continuity of African heritage and the integration of the majority culture, Herskovitz presents four questions:

- Are death-related rituals a form of a survival?
- Is (any event) a response to the dominant culture?
- What are the values of the socioeconomically disadvantaged group in question?
- What are the unique themes of being “black” in America?

Kalish and Reynolds’ response to the last question is to be “black” in America, is to be “part of a history told in terms of contact with death and coping with death.” As with African-American culture, African-American burial customs, especially contemporary customs, are the result of African-Americans continuously adapting and adjusting to American ideas. These customs continue to reflect the synthesis of “tradition and innovation,” beginning with the colonial period and slave graveyards.

---
35 Kalish and Reynolds, 103.
36 Barrett, 92.
Although we have few sources on the everyday lives of slaves, we do have significant records on their death rates. Gilyard and Wardi have described enslaved African-American experiences through death and survival: “the middle passage was both symbolically and literally a voyage of death, and rituals concerning the dead survived the ordeal…certainly African-American burial [sites] and the accompanying mortuary customs are material signs of the vitality and continuation of African cultures in America.”

Most slave funerals were conducted at night in order to evade unwilling masters or to allow other slaves to attend the funeral when work was finished (Fig. 13). Typically, early slave burial sites contained uninscribed, hand-carved fieldstones or wooden pieces (Fig. 14). This is a direct result of laws passed in the 1830s barring Africans from access to education. 

Slave masters often allowed their slaves to conduct their own funerary rites, however, due to the fear of rebellion, state laws passed between the 1750s to the 1830s “prohibited” slaves from gathering more than a “handful” and funerals were to be performed “during the day or when a white man was present to officiate.”

Another general characteristic of African slave burials was the holding of “first” and “second” burials. In Africa, the second burial could occur up to three years after interment, however in the Americas, slaves typically waited weeks or months after the first burial. Slaves were typically buried in according to their relationship to their masters and not necessarily according to their family relationships. Bodies were typically laid with the head facing toward the west and the feet facing toward the east based on the belief in Judgement Day, on which the bodies will rise, facing Africa and would be able to find their way back home. Also, the deceased were buried with a personal object from their everyday life to both keep them company in the afterlife as well as to prevent them from returning to the living to retrieve the item (Fig. 15).

---

38 Rainville.
39 Ibid., 52.
41 Rainville.
African slave burial site was discovered in lower Manhattan, the African Burial Ground, near a poorhouse (Fig. 16). This site was only unearthed after the excavation for a future federal office building in 1991, and the site was partially preserved and incorporated into a monument in 2007 (Fig. 17).

Presently, most African-Americans bury their loved ones in the non-segregated, mostly non-sectarian cemeteries, yet many will still bury their family members in de facto segregated cemeteries such as Eden as connection to their family history and “roots.”42 African-Americans still follow similar funerary preparations carried over from slavery and with aspects of Western culture, which include the preparation for death, elaborate displays of grief and sit-ups and wakes, and the funeral home-going ceremony (Fig. 18).43 Post-1865 burial activities used the funeral as a form of pageantry, which celebrated the decease’s life instead of mourning their death. These funerals were often unstructured, which allowed for moments of “spontaneity” in the celebration.44 In the 1900s, it became tradition to leave the casket open for viewing, a moment for “laying on hands” to bless the deceased.45 By the 1950s, African-American funerary services began to use printed funeral programs, giving more structure to the service. Barrett believes that this suppressed African traditions while gravitating toward Western influences in burying.

African-American culture and common burial customs provide the basis for the design and organization of African-American burial landscapes. These landscapes are the direct results of African-American displacement, in the study of movement, seen in the formation of slave graveyards, and de jure segregation in potter’s fields and non-sectarian nineteenth century rural and cemeteries. As will be discussed in chapter three on types of African-American burial sites, the burial

42 According to Jones there are a few non-African-American people buried in Eden cemetery. The people who have been identified were spouses buried with their family. There is a notable amount of people of Filipino descent buried in the cemetery through marriage.
43 For more detail on burial African-American burial customs, see Barrett’s article.
44 Barrett, 91.
45 Holloway.
landscape for African-Americans begins to symbolize values based on religious beliefs, unification, sacredness, and dignity, which was not afforded to blacks living in Philadelphia until the development of the churchyards and not fully conceived until the establishment of cemeteries such as Lebanon, Olive, and then eventually Eden. The racial politics involved in the creation of cemeteries, such as Eden, represent the formation of African-American burial sites responding to and solving the issue of the color line. This is a significant aspect of the cultural landscape of African-American burial sites and their retention of cultural memory and history.

Chapter Two: Types of African-American Burial Sites

African-American burial landscapes are “symbols of African-American heritage and the continuity of cultural tradition.” Burial sites function as “sites of memory” and are “significant repositories of African-American history, memory, and culture.”46 African-American burial sites are special collections of ancestral responses to burial displacement and burial service discrimination.47 In By the Work of Their Hands: Studies in Afro-American Folk Life, Vlach argues that for African-Americans, burial sites have had “special significance…[being] one of the few places in America where an overt black identity could be asserted and maintained.”48 Henderson characterizes African-American burial landscapes as places for “healing the spirit” by interacting and adding to the collection of history and cultural traditions.49 The formation of African-American burial landscapes are not isolated events; these sites have geographical and political connections which exist as part of the makeup of American society and history. Similar to other ethnic groups grappling with issues of burial, African-American burial sites have evolved from the black-only sections of potter’s fields to suburban

46 Henderson, 2.
47 Ibid.
49 Henderson, 2.
cemeteries. Eden Cemetery’s significance begins with the development of pre-nineteenth-century burial sites and continues with many of those that were condemned. Displacement of African-American burial landscapes in Philadelphia led to Eden Cemetery emerging as a repository of African-American memory and culture in burial practices and traditions.

Before discussing the evolution of African-American burial landscapes in Philadelphia from the eighteenth century to the twentieth century, it is important to establish the burial site terminology that will be used in the remaining sections of this thesis. Burial grounds, often used as a catch-all term to describe cemeteries, churchyards, and graveyards, will be used to describe a minority section of a larger burial site such as a potter’s field. These smaller subsections tended to resemble cemeteries in their visible structural features, which included boundaries and individual markers. Churchyards, are burial sites connected to a church building.\textsuperscript{50} Churchyards have defined boundaries, and a distinctive entrance. These burial sites were typically located in the center of the town on small tracts of land and the graves were often reused by the family or close friends. According to Rugg, “ownership and purpose is inextricably linked with the sacred nature of churchyards.”\textsuperscript{51} Cemeteries, an invention of European nineteenth-century pastoral rural landscapes, were created to establish a clear distance from the city center and the burial landscape, “protecting the dead from disturbance and…sequestering the dead from the living.”\textsuperscript{52} Curl defines cemeteries as “a burial [site], especially a large landscaped park or ground laid out expressly for the deposition or interment of the dead, not being a churchyard attached to a place of worship.”\textsuperscript{53} Located close, but not within settlements similar to churchyards, cemeteries could be larger in size and serve a wider community. Cemeteries

\textsuperscript{50} Typically, churchyards were owned by the national church. In the African-American experience, the African Methodist Episcopal and the African Episcopal Church of St. Thomas were the national churches for Methodist churches serving African-Americans.

\textsuperscript{51} Julie Rugg, “Defining the place of burial: what makes a cemetery a cemetery?” \textit{Mortality} 5, no. 3 (United Kingdom: University of York, 2000): 265.

\textsuperscript{52} Ibid., 261.

\textsuperscript{53} Rugg’s article on burial sites definitions goes into detail the difference between churchyards and cemeteries, in “churchyards are often small tracts of burial land owned by and located close to the Church and used over centuries, while cemeteries --- often larger in scale and predominantly owned by secular authorities --- have been in common use only since the 19th century.” 261.
provided the opportunity to memorialize a particular individual with a decorative headstone or cenotaph instead of marking larger family or community groupings with a single headstone. The entrances of cemeteries symbolize the value the local community places on the site, which is usually represented in the architectural style, size, and material usage. The last defining characteristic of a cemetery is that it is typically non-sectarian, but depending on the community it serves, the cemetery has the potential to house a significant number of people adhering to the same religion. Socially and spiritually, cemeteries are also considered sacred by the families who have buried their loved ones there. In *The Last Great Necessity*, Sloane writes that the cemetery was “intended to be a lesson for the commercial society it mirrored...the cemetery would be an island of peace in the maelstrom of society.” The purpose of the site is formally defined before use, which was not typical with potter’s fields or in a few early nineteenth-century churchyards where people may have been buried as a last resort. Rugg states that cemeteries are “specifically demarcated sites of burial, with an ordered internal layout that is conducive both to families claiming control over their grave spaces, and to the conducting of what might be deemed by the community as appropriate funerary ritual.” Cemeteries also hold political as well as social meanings, especially in the case of condemned cemeteries in Philadelphia, such as Olive and Lebanon, where white racism in the Jim Crow era forced the establishment of separate black cemeteries.

The year 1639 marks the earliest record of slaves arriving in Philadelphia and by 1694, 154 enslaved Africans were documented in the city census. Segregation of burial sites during the institution of slavery applied to both slave states and free states. Unfortunately, little documentation exists on a linear historical format on the development of slave graveyards. Information on slave

---

54 For more information on cemetery land and expansion patterns, see Richard V. Francaviglia’s “The Cemetery as an Evolving Cultural Landscape.”
56 Rugg, 259.
graveyards has largely been gathered from the lives of independent slave owners and what they recorded about their slaves. Slave graveyards did not contain traditional European-American headstone markers and were often either isolated and/or secretly hidden away from the plantation owner. Slave graveyards were usually located on land that was considered to be unusable by the planter. African slave graveyards were “hidden away in remote spots among trees and underbrush…in the middle of some fields are islands of large trees the owners preferred not to make arable, because of the exhaustive work of clearing it…old graves are now in among these trees and surrounding underbrush.” Eighteenth-century enslaved blacks living in Philadelphia were also buried in the black-only sections of the potter’s field due to the availability of burying land within the city limits. Recently, there have been cases of slave burial sites across the country being “re-discovered” accidentally during construction. The African Burial Ground in Manhattan and a site of 3,000 graves found underneath Philadelphia’s Mother Bethel African Methodist Episcopal Church in 2013 are prominent examples. However, most examples of this burial type are difficult to search for, let alone preserve, because of their past destruction and difficulties of detection. The Bethel burying ground was originally the Negroes’ section of the Stranger’s’ Burying Ground, a potter’s field, renamed Washington Square in 1825, located near 7th and Walnut Streets. This site was converted into the Weccacoe Playground in 1910 by the Philadelphia Department of Recreation.

The city consigned enslaved and free African-Americans, the poor, prisoners, and strangers to these potter’s fields, which were located in the public squares and almshouse burial sites (Fig. 19). These grounds were originally set aside beginning in the 1700s for the “interment of those

---

60 In Philadelphia, all of the known potter’s fields have been either destroyed or incorporated into another burial ground.
persons viewed as outsiders—who were not members of local churches, were poor, or who
otherwise lived at the margins of the established Philadelphia social order, and due to this status, they
often fell into disrepair.”63 These potter’s field plots were often left unmarked and lacked regular
maintenance. The burial ground sections were also segregated between persons of European
ancestry, enslaved and free people of African descent, and Catholics. Soldiers who had died during
the Revolutionary War and casualties of the 1793-1794 yellow fever epidemic were also interred in
these burial sites. Although the fields were stigmatized, African-Americans revered their sections as
sacred, with petitions for fencing in these sections beginning in the nineteenth century. Often in
segregated burial sites, marginalized ethnic groups perceived their burial sections and rituals as an
“expression and negotiation of identity and values.”64 These sites were also subjected to illegal
activities, including vandalism, which eventually led to the creation of inner city churchyards joined
to African-American churches and the abandonment of most of the potter’s fields in the nineteenth
century.

Churchyards were established after Emancipation and with the creation of formal African-
American national churches. Philadelphia became home to one of the largest free African-American
communities in the country in the eighteenth century, allowing for African-American churches to
flourish and bury their dead on private sacred land.65 The earliest African-American owned and
governed churchyards in the city developed with the founding of Mother Bethel African Methodist
Episcopal Church and the African Episcopal Church of St. Thomas (Fig. 20).66 Initially, African-
Americans joined the larger integrated Methodist and Baptist churches because of the less strict

63 Mooney and Morrell.
64 Anne M. Palkovich and Ann Korologos Bazaronne, “Monuments in Motion: Gravemarkers, Cemeteries, and Memorials
as Material Form and Context,” in The Handbook of Death and Dying: Volume Two, Response to Death, ed. Clifton D.Bryant
65 Edward D. Smith, Climbing Jacob’s Ladder: The Rise of Black Churches in Eastern American Cities, 1740-1877 (Washington, D.C.
66 Mooney and Morrell.
church relationships among the congregations that were present in other denominations.67 However, the blacks who joined these churches were soon subjected to segregation, often regulated toward the back or the balconies during worship. In 1792, Richard Allen and a group of African-American parishioners left the St. George’s Methodist Episcopal Church. Along with Absalom Jones, Allen founded the Free African Society in April 1787, an organization whose main goal was to provide “aid to newly freed blacks so that they could gather strength and develop leaders in the community.”69 The Free African Society also arranged burial services usually denied to blacks in Philadelphia.70 Jones later founded the African Episcopalian Church of St. Thomas due to disagreements with those led by Allen and in 1816, Allen founded the African Methodist Episcopal Church.71 In the urban center of Philadelphia in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, churchyards were bounded by residential and commercial housing.72 The general layout of black family burial grounds and churchyards were noticeably different from the white churchyards. Similar to white churchyards, graves were oriented east-west, with the head facing west and the feet facing toward the east, however, black graves were not aligned parallel to one another.73 Also in black churchyards, families were loosely grouped and the placement of individual graves within these groupings had no distinguishable order. Often in archaeological investigations, these groupings appear to be irregular and “strongly individualistic.”74 African-Americans used hand-crafted headstones often made out of perishable materials, which accounts for the non-existence of many grave markers. In the 1800s, a

67 Smith, 31-33.
70 Keels.
72 Ibid.
significant number of the African-American owned churchyards were disbanded and the graves relocated to larger non-sectarian rural cemeteries near the edge of the city.

After 1847, many states were given the authorization to build cemeteries outside of the city, further separating places of burial from the city center due to fear of the spread of disease. City graveyards were thought to exude “gases that aided in the transmission of disease cities.” However, graveyards were only improved upon until these rural cemeteries were designed based on British rural cemetery landscapes. These non-sectarian cemeteries “embodied” traditional rural cemetery characteristics which included a “family monument, planned landscape, picturesque vistas, rolling roadways, and location outside of the city [core].” This new type of burial site became the answer to the “confusion and complexity” of the city’s overcrowded nature. Rural cemeteries were founded in 1849 for African-Americans who were excluded from other rural non-sectarian cemetery companies. Many of the African-American churchyards in the city where relocated to the two African-American cemeteries, Olive and Lebanon. However, these cemeteries fell into disrepair and were eventually condemned due to improvements in the sanitary and sewage systems. In 1899, Lebanon was condemned and in 1902 the property was sold and all of the graves were reinterred in Eden Cemetery (Fig. 21). In 1903, Olive was condemned and by 1923, most of the graves were

---

75 Sloane, 11.
76 Ibid., 66.
77 For more information on the creation of cemeteries in general, see chapter on cemeteries from 1796-1949 in The Last Great Nevisity. From 1855-1917, rural cemeteries replaced the colonial graveyard, however these cemeteries became overcrowded which negated the original intent of their use. Rural cemeteries were then “re-fashioned” into less ornate landscapes and took after urban parks and suburbs, called law-parks. In the early 20th century, memorial parks were created to retain the legacy of rural cemeteries.
78 Mooney and Morrell.
79 In W.E.B DuBois’ The Philadelphia Negro, exclusion from other non-sectarian cemetery companies led to the creation of two significant African-American cemetery companies: Olive and Lebanon. Merion was also mentioned, but this cemetery was not initially created specifically as an African-American cemetery. Merion is not mentioned in research as a cemetery that was abandoned and/or re-located to Eden Cemetery and is also located outside of the city limits of Philadelphia.
relocated to Eden as well (Fig. 22). Smaller non-sectarian cemeteries such as Stephen Smith Home Burial Ground were also closed and the graves reinterred in Eden.81

At the turn of the twentieth century, a group of black leaders gathered together to design a final resting place for African-Americans living in the Philadelphia as well as the final resting place for those who had been buried in the abandoned segregated cemeteries and churchyards. Jerome Bacon, the principle founder of Eden, sought to provide a “unified” cemetery located in Collingdale for graves from Lebanon and Olive, as well as the smaller burial sites that had not been disturbed up until this time. This new cemetery type, the lawn-park, provided relief to the black community after the closures of Lebanon and Olive, which were not only the victims of racial politics, but also city growth that had not affected other rural cemeteries serving the European-American populations, such as Laurel Hill and the Woodlands. These cemeteries were free from new city improvements due to their distant locations from the urban center. Eden, a lawn-park cemetery, has distinct qualities that represent the next step in burial beyond Olive and Lebanon. It is a suburban cemetery located in a borough next to the urban center, but not threatened by the city limits as Lebanon and Olive had been. Eden is an example of African-Americans adopting lawn-park landscape features in suburban cemetery design and tradition. Eden is also a “collector cemetery” for older condemned African-American burial sites.

Lawn-park cemeteries were first introduced in the United States in 1855 by Adolph Strauch, and these cemetery types called for more open land, allowing for more space between graves.82 Rural cemeteries appeared to be cluttered due to the closeness of the graves and lots. Lawn-park cemeteries were also seen as the “accomplishment of corporate community goals,” which falls in line with the aims of the founders of Eden who sought to create a community institution. The lawn-park was

81 A few of the graves from the Stephen Smith Home Burial Ground and Olive Cemetery were also re-interred in Mount Zion Cemetery, which is housed next door to Eden Cemetery. “Eden Cemetery,” USGenArchives.net.
meant to be an open space with clear views, situated on rolling hills, while “accentuating” the openness of the graves, which was not seen in rural cemeteries. According to Farrell, the lawn-park meant to “suggest the pleasures of a park more than the meditative mysteries of a cemetery,” essentially becoming more about the landscape than those who were buried there. It is also worthy to note that the most character-defining feature of a lawn-park cemetery is its pre-determined plan. Eden was originally planned with the John Brown and Celestine sections. John Brown is located on top of the receiving vault and Celestine is located toward the post-1930s entrance on Springfield Road. The lawn-park cemetery movement continued in Philadelphia until the 1920s.84

The founders, who, besides Bacon, included John C. Asbury, Daniel W. Parvis, Martin J. Lehmann and Charles W. Jones, chose Collingdale, a location south of the city center, for its closeness to the city, its beautiful landscape, its size, and its affordability. The first burial service, for Celestine Cromwell, the wife of Willis Cromwell, a member of the advisory board for the Eden Cemetery Company, was scheduled for August 11, 1902. However, her burial service was moved to the next day, August 12, 1902, in the evening due to the protest of the white residents living in the area.85 This particular event harkens distantly, perhaps, to the era when slaves needed to bury their loved ones at night. Celestine (named after Celestine Cromwell), Lebanon, Home, and Olive are four of the five original sections of Eden, and Lebanon and Olive are memorials to the two African-American cemeteries that were condemned. The cemetery expanded into an additional twenty-three sections named after famous African-Americans and as well as influential Americans, such as Abraham Lincoln. By 2007, 80,000 people were interred at Eden.86

83 Farrell, 115.
85 Wilson.
Chapter Three: Eden Cemetery, a Twentieth-Century Suburban Cemetery

Eden Cemetery’s origins lie in the displacement and abandonment of Philadelphia’s pre-twentieth-century black burial sites. Although white burial sites were also condemned in the nineteenth century as Philadelphia grew, these sites had the possibility of being relocated to a number of places already established for burial. However, besides the few churchyards still operating, there was no single cemetery available for blacks near Philadelphia that could retain bodies from the condemned black cemeteries. Eden “collected” literally all of Philadelphia’s displaced black burial sites outside of the city. This continued the African-American experience with displacement and relocation seen before with the relocation of churchyards to Olive and Lebanon in 1849, yet created a new burial type represented as a suburban lawn-park cemetery. Eden Cemetery became a site of literal, as well as symbolic, unification for condemned African-American cemeteries and churchyards in Philadelphia. Eden’s survival well into the twenty-first century is significant in that it defied the habitual demolition and abandonment of burial sites serving African-Americans living in Philadelphia in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Currently, there are no reports, besides the current 2010 National Historic Register Nomination, that analyze the history and significance of Eden. In addition, no scholarship takes into account Eden’s legacy in relationship to the displacement and discrimination of African-American burial sites. Eden Cemetery, the only solution to house displaced urban black burial sites in Philadelphia, developed into a “metropolitan institution” that had the ability to serve a wider community, which was not seen in white communities at the time. This piece of Eden’s history should be emphasized in future work focused its contribution to the historical narrative of African-American burial landscapes.

Eden Cemetery’s origins lie ultimately in the first public effort of blacks in Philadelphia to claim a burial place of their own: requesting permission to fence a portion of the city’s potter’s fields. This was an outgrowth of black leaders developing communal institutions after the American
Revolutionary War to serve the black community for burial needs. Prominent blacks in the community attempted to convince the local government about the importance of sending their loved ones “home” in a clearly marked and sanctified space; this marked the “first civil and political assertions of independence and self-determination” by members of the black community in this period. Eden was the next step, in the “color line” of burial separation in a Jim Crow era, after the black community began with creating respected black burial spaces with Lebanon and Olive, however this cemetery represented a space where African-Americans adapted the elements of lawn-park cemeteries that had been the suburban answer to the rural cemetery movement in the nineteenth century. Lawn-parks integrated elements of the suburb into a memorial for the dead: open green spaces, pathways, and artificial or landscaped lakes. These new features were used to mask the “morbid” atmosphere of rural cemeteries. Eden cemetery is tightly bounded by residential and commercial buildings, and the landscape is not traditionally “picturesque” compared to other white cemeteries in Philadelphia, such as the Woodlands. However, Eden’s significance lies with its response to the closure of Philadelphia’s nineteenth-century burial sites. The “color line,” the spatial intersection between racism exhibited in domination and resistance, confronted Eden in the form of a struggle the founders faced when attempting to establish the cemetery in 1902. Eden cemetery represents the developing “autonomy” in the Philadelphia African-American community at the turn of the twentieth century that was the outgrowth of black-owned churchyards, as well. Churchyards were the precedent for other sites such as Lebanon and Olive, where blacks could bury their dead in black owned burial sites. However, Eden Cemetery differs from these sites and most of Philadelphia’s black churchyards in that it has survived for more than 100 years as well as serving as the final resting place for burials transferred from condemned cemeteries and churchyards in

88 Mooney and Morrell, B.1.
89 Sloane.
90 Dubois, The Souls of Black Folk.
91 Mooney and Morrell.
Philadelphia’s urban center. Additionally, Eden differs greatly from pre-1902 burial sites due to its suburban location, lawn-park organization, and retention of older African-American burial sites.

**Eden Cemetery’s Origins, 1902.**

The Borough of Collingdale in Delaware County, Pennsylvania is home to Eden Cemetery. Three other cemeteries are also located in Collingdale. The oldest, Mount Zion Methodist Meeting Cemetery was established in 1808 as a burial site for veterans of the Revolutionary War, and later the War of 1812, and American Civil War. The others are Har Zion and Mount Lebanon, both of which were established to serve the Jewish Community living in Collingdale and surrounding environs. Mount Lebanon is divided into two sections, the newest section, Brith Achim Memorial Park, is typically considered to be an independent burial site separate from the older section. Much of Collingdale is covered by these four cemeteries, limiting space for the development of more residential and business zones (Fig. 23 - 24). The borough was incorporated into Delaware County on December 23, 1891 and expanded in 1894. The last ordinance authorizing land expansion was issued in 1922 and the borough has retained these ordinance boundaries since. In 1892, the land that would be later purchased for Eden Cemetery was owned by two Bartram family members, Thomas and Isaac (Fig. 25 - 26). This land was originally part of the larger Bartram family farm, which originated in 1699, and retained the ancestral farm house at the time of the land purchase for Eden cemetery in 1902.

---

92 There are four black owned suburban cemeteries near Philadelphia for African-Americans to bury their loved ones. They are Eden, Mount Lawn in Sharon Hill, Merion Cemetery in Bala Cynwyd, and Fairview in Willow Grove. Both Merion and Fairview are located in Montgomery County.
94 Exact date of the establishment of Har Zion and Mount Lebanon cemeteries is unknown. According to Elizabeth Macquire, President of the Collingdale Historical Society and has authored a book, Collingdale Borough, Arcadia Press, there seems to have been a prominent Jewish community living next door in Darby that may have contributed to the founding of Har Zion and Mount Lebanon.
95 Wardell.
97 Bird.
Eden confronted the immediate need of burial services for the black community when one of the major black only cemeteries was condemned before the Eden Cemetery Company charter was signed on June 20th, 1902. In 1899, Lebanon Cemetery, a private African-American cemetery operated by Jacob C. White, Sr. and later his son Jacob C. White, Jr., at Passyunk Avenue and 19th street in the South Philadelphia city limits, was condemned and eventually closed in January 1901. By 1900, due to street expansion, the size of the cemetery dropped from eleven acres “to less than” six, and in January 1901, the Philadelphia Bureau of Health ordered for the cemetery to be closed. The cemetery was sold to the city for $90,000 and the intersection of Passyunk Avenue and 19th Street were straightened for transportation usage. Philadelphia Cemetery, a non-African-American cemetery, located next to Lebanon on Passyunk Avenue was also condemned. Bacon and Eden’s Board members learned about the closing of Lebanon and worked with White, Jr. to re-inter the bodies from the cemetery into Eden. A document from October 27th, 1896, also shows a possible interment negotiation between the managers of Lebanon and Merion Cemeteries. The latter had accepted African-American burials from its inception, and the only cemetery, besides Lebanon and Olive to be mentioned in W.E.B. DuBois’ study, The Philadelphia Negro. DuBois’ study highlights the importance of these two sites. To be mentioned in this study suggests that burial spaces were few and far between for the African-American community in the late nineteenth century, and up until this time, most African-Americans had been buried in either Lebanon, Olive, Merion, or in black churchyards. The Merion Cemetery Company proposition proposed two options for those who had loved ones buried in Eden: either 1) to move their grave or graves to Merion to exchange their 8 x 10 lots for an 8 x 10 lot in Merion, or 2) those who did not want to move to Merion were allowed the

98 Thomas J. Scharf and Thompson Westcott, The History of Philadelphia, 1609 – 1884 (Philadelphia: L. H. Everts and Company, 1884). These African-American cemeteries at the time of their founding in 1849 (Lebanon on January 24, 1849 and Olive on May 28th, 1849) were located in what could be considered the “rural ideal” for cemetery sites. However, by 1889, these cemeteries were confronted on all sides by the outgrowth of the city, which ultimately aided in their condemnation. (See figures 21 and 22).


choice of “removing their dead at their own expense to a place of their own selection (Fig. 27).

However, it appears that Eden was selected for reinterment of all of the burials from Lebanon in 1902.\footnote{There have been no sources suggesting otherwise that graves were moved to Merion outside of Eden.}

The Lebanon Cemetery Company bought a plot in Eden in December 1902, and its graves were interred there shortly after by the Harris Engineering Company located in Darcy. In 1903, The Stephen Smith Home for the Aged and Infirm purchased a plot in Eden for interment of its disbanded cemetery\footnote{Deed Book F11 Page 436, July 15th 1903 (recorded July 20th, 1903). Stephen Smith had also bought a plot in Lebanon Cemetery on June 4, 1849.}, and in 1923, the Olive Cemetery Company, located next to the Stephen Smith Home for the Aged and the Infirm at 44th and Girard Avenue in West Philadelphia, purchased a plot and interred its graves in Eden as well.\footnote{“Eden Cemetery Marks 50 Years.”} At the time of its closing, Olive was eight acres wide.

Remains from Olive were moved to Eden as well as Mount Zion Meeting Cemetery.\footnote{Keels, 85.} The abandonment of these cemeteries was the result of the Philadelphia Bureau of Health condemning cemeteries on built up land in the city as a “sanitary necessity”, when Philadelphia grew in the late 1800s and early 1900s.\footnote{McLeary.} According to Jones, no maps or records came with the graves from Olive nor Lebanon.

In response to the condemnation of Lebanon, Jerome Bacon, possibly a teacher at the Institute for Colored Youth in Philadelphia, pitched the idea of a unified “negro cemetery” situated outside the city limits to his colleagues, the eventual founders of the Eden Cemetery Company.\footnote{According to Jones, there is no documentation linking Bacon to the Institute for Colored Youth, even though there have been reports linking him to this school. Jones believes that Bacon taught business classes at the “Y” on Christian Street in Philadelphia.} Land was purchased on the the former Bartram Family farm, between Springfield Road and Bartram Avenue, next to the Mount Zion.\footnote{According to a 1940 Sanborn Insurance and Real Estate Map, Springfield Road was once named Springfield Avenue. The rest of this thesis will refer to the street as Springfield Road per the current conditions. “Eden Cemetery Marks 50 Years of Historic Service to City,” The Philadelphia Tribune, Saturday, December 27, 1952.} The land was bought in 1897 by John J. Tyler from the County
of Delaware through a sheriff’s sale. John J. Tyler and his wife, Laura Painter Tyler, were affluent Quaker s who owned sixty-eight acres of land used for an arboretum in Media in Delaware County. The Tyler’s sold the land former Bartram land to John C. Asbury, who then was able to sell the land to the Eden Cemetery Company. Bacon was concerned with the rampant closures of cemetery companies serving African-Americans in Philadelphia, and, along with fellow founders, set out to provide a space for the “remains from condemned cemeteries in Philadelphia and to also provide a future resting place for African-Americans.” The first charter meeting for the establishment of Eden was attended by John C. Asbury, the first president, Bacon, the first secretary, Charles W. Jones, a vice president and director, Martin J. Lehmann, the first treasurer, and Daniel W. Parvis, a vice president and manager. The cemetery corporation was recognized by the Delaware County Court of Pleas on April 21st 1902, and on June 20, 1902, the charter for Eden was signed, however it encountered fierce opposition from the white residents in Collingdale. The official name for the cemetery according to the original June 20th charter was the Eden Cemetery Company (Fig. 28).

Due to the racial tensions in Collingdale, which sprang mostly from those who owned land from the nine founding families, which included the LaRoche family, the Boon family, the Harris family, the Bartam family, and the Morton family, the cemetery company was confronted with legal issues from the very beginning. In July 1902, two injunctions were filed concerning a “colored camp meeting” being held on land owned by Thomas Bartram and the proposal for an African-

---

108 Sheriff Deed Book I page 260, May 3, 1897; Sale of land from the County of Delaware to John J. Tyler.
109 Deed Book 10 page 493, 394, August 23, 1902; Sale of Land from John J. and Laura Tyler to John C. Asbury. Deed Book 010 page 361, October 27, 1902 (recorded October 29, 1902); Sale of land from John C. and Ida Asbury to the Eden Cemetery Company.
111 Charter of the Eden Cemetery Company, June 20, 1902.
112 Bird. This opposition from the people of Collingdale who represent the nine founding families demonstrates the hardships African-Americans faced in terms of purchasing large tracts of land. The presence of the Quaker s in Collingdale, i.e. John J. Tyler and Laura Tyler, may have been the most prominent reason as to how the founders of Eden were able to obtain such a large tract of land for the purposes of burying black bodies. The instance of the colored meeting camp also signifies a strong presence of Quaker s working toward rights for African-Americans in Delaware County. From the research, there seems to be a divide between those in Collingdale who actively fought against blacks coming into the borough (descendants of the nine families), and those who were Quaker s. Both of these groups have had a long history associated with Collingdale.
American cemetery on another piece of Bartram property.\footnote{113} The camp meeting grounds had been leased by Rev. J.H. Presbury from a man named Barny Carr.\footnote{114} According to land ownership documents of the Borough of Collingdale, Thomas Bartram was in possession of the farm land since 1892 and the borough “hastily” passed these injunctions citing both the colored meeting camp and the cemetery as a “health measure” in order to prevent the establishment of Eden.\footnote{115} The injunction stopped the proposal for the camp meeting, but the borough, Eden’s founders, and others invested in Eden’s survival continued the fight over the cemetery.\footnote{116} Asbury, in response to the racial tensions over the new “colored” cemetery in Collingdale, stated that if the cemetery were not to be built, the land purchased for that purpose would be sold to African-Americans. During a town hall meeting, He asked pointedly: “Which would you rather have – a dead nigger or a live one?”; knowing that those who protested the decision would be provoked by such a question (Fig. 29).\footnote{117} In the same town hall meeting, Asbury made the argument that council could not “prohibit an enterprise of this character unless it is proven beyond doubt to be a public nuisance.”\footnote{118} Asbury further argued that the ordinance was invalid because it had passed at a “special meeting” at which “general business was transacted…and that the rules under which council is working have never been properly adopted according to the Act of Assembly.”\footnote{119} Due to Asbury’s persistence, the conflict was eventually brought to the state court.

On September 29th, 1902, the borough filed an ordinance to confront the cemetery company. Ordinance No. 58, presented by the borough’s legal counsel, used fears of disease as a pretext for banning new cemeteries in Collingdale. In the common plea hearing on the Borough of

\footnote{113} “Cemetery Notes,” \textit{Park and Cemetery and Landscape Gardening (1900-1931)}, November 1, 1902. By the time of the injunction, the cemetery company had already purchased fifty acres of its current land.
\footnote{114} \textit{Chester Times}, Oct. 23, 1902.
\footnote{115} “The Collingdale Case,” \textit{The Delaware County Times}, Thursday, August 14, 1902.
\footnote{116} The “Collingdale Case” article also makes a special note about Eden’s cemetery corporation being composed of both white and black people. This could be a reference to the deed sale between John Tyler and John C. Asbury, which indicates that some whites were on the move to help establish this cemetery.
\footnote{117} “A Startling Query: President Asbury Wants to Know if Collingdale Wants Dead Niggers or Live Ones,” \textit{Delaware County Daily Times}, August 22, 1902.
\footnote{118} “Cemetery Notes,” \textit{Park and Cemetery and Landscape Gardening (1900-1931)}, November 1, 1902.
\footnote{119} Ibid.
Collingdale v. Eden Cemetery Company, representatives of the borough issued Ordinance No. 58, which stated:

It shall be unlawful for any persons or persons, association or corporation to establish any cemetery or burying ground, or use for the purpose of interment of human bodies any ground within the limits of said borough…the interment or burial of any human body in a place within the said borough, excepting in the existing cemetery, is declared to be a nuisance and is hereby prohibited.120

Judge Isaac Johnson initially ruled in favor of the borough, but the decision was overturned in December 1902.121 Before the final decision, the Eden Cemetery Company was not allowed to remove bodies from the condemned Lebanon Cemetery.122 According to Judge Johnson the case hinged on two issues: 1) whether the “ordinance was legally passed” and, 2) “whether the authorities exceeded police power.”123 Although the cemetery company met further aggression from the non-Quaker white community, it managed to bring suit against a man who attempted to prevent the first burial at Eden.124 As part of the court decision, the Eden Cemetery Company offered to contribute to the Collingdale borough $1,000 toward fixing roads as well as re-interring 4,000 bodies from a condemned black cemetery in Philadelphia, which was possibly Lebanon.125 Finally, on August 11, 1902, “six men stripped off their coats, picked up shovels and began to dig a grave on a section of [Bartram] farm land.”126 This first burial, for Celestine Mosley Cromwell (Fig. 30), became the foundation for the Celestine section, however, the John Brown section was first used for burials after the Cromwell burial. John Brown is above the receiving vault and near the possible original entrance for the cemetery at Bartram Avenue. Cromwell’s burial was cancelled due to protest, and the body

---

120 Cemeteries, certain locations prohibited; Exemptions (1902).
122 “The Eden Cemetery: Interment of Bodies Can Proceed Pending the Litigation,” The Delaware County Times, Tuesday, December 2, 1902.
123 “Cemetery Notes,” Park and Cemetery and Landscape Gardening (1900-1931), November 1, 1902.
124 “Asbury Wants to Get Into His Eden: Another Chapter in the Collingdale Cemetery Case, Suit for Alleged Trespass. President of the Colored Burial Begins Action Against J. W. Simpson Because Interment Was Refused to the Body of a Colored Man in a Cemetery Chartered by the Court,” The Delaware County Times, Thursday, August 14, 1902.
125 This could be in reference to Lebanon Cemetery. The fee for each interment was $1.00.
was not taken back to Philadelphia, but instead it was taken to Mount Zion for burial the next day. Celestine is now the name of one of the most prestigious sections of Eden Cemetery, where two of the founders and other influential nineteenth-century and twentieth-century African-Americans are buried. All these men who performed the first burial, except one, were the cemetery’s charter members.

*The Founders of Eden Cemetery Company.*

A 1974 *Philadelphia Tribune* article on Eden Cemetery credited, “the success of Eden…to the foresight, determination and business acumen of its charter members and to the progressive policy of those who have operated it in the intervening years.” These five men, John C. Asbury, Jerome Bacon, Charles W. Jones, Martin J. Lehmann, and Daniel W. Parvis, were all prominent citizens in Philadelphia black’s community in the late nineteenth century. Although their career paths were divergent, these men managed to make an indelible mark on the history of metropolitan Philadelphia by creating a permanent non-sectarian place of burial for African-Americans as the city’s two major non-sectarian black cemeteries closed and were displaced by new development.

John C. Asbury (1862-1941) was a lawyer by training, although he tried his hand at other professions over the course of his life. He completed his education at Washington and Jefferson College and Howard University. In 1886, he married Kate E. Allen who died in 1898. He then married Ida Elizabeth Bowser, a member of the eminent Bustill-Bowser family, three years later. He was also a businessman and an elected city official known for his charity work in Philadelphia. Besides helping to found Eden, Asbury was the director of the city’s Mercy Hospital and Keystone Aid Insurance Company. He also served as a trustee of Union Baptist Church, a well-known institution that counted Marian Anderson among its members. The *Afro-American* in 1941 further notes that he was at one time an “assistant city solicitor, member of the State Legislature and

127 “The Eden Cemetery Company,”
Assistant U.S. District Attorney.” 126 According to Richard Sand of the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, Asbury “was the most prominent African-American politician in Pennsylvania in the first half of the twentieth-century.” 129 On March 29, 1921, Asbury, as a Republican state legislator, introduced a civil-rights bill that would have granted black Pennsylvanians full citizenship. This passed the House but failed in the Senate. At the time of the signing of Eden’s company charter, Asbury lived at 1132 Lombard Street in Philadelphia, near the center of the 7th ward formerly studied by Dubois. He died in 1941 and was buried in the Celestine section of Eden (Fig. 31).

Asbury’s other occupations included contributing to the Odd Fellows Journal, which was established by Charles H. Brooks, a public school teacher at Downington, an assistant city solicitor (1916-1920), Sunday school superintendent at Union Baptist Church, a Republican member of the state assembly (1921-1925), Republican leader of the city’s 13th ward, organized the Keystone Aid Society in 1902, the director of the Keystone Bank in 1922, and an assistant district attorney. There is a historical marker in front of Asbury’s last residence at 1710 Christian Street, Philadelphia detailing his work beyond Eden Cemetery and the political sphere.

Jerome Bacon (1857-1913) was the principle founder and organizer of Eden Cemetery. A native of Virginia, Bacon may have been a teacher at Philadelphia’s famed Institute for Colored Youth located on Bainbridge Street near 9th in Philadelphia, teaching business subjects such as bookkeeping and stenography. 130 Bacon taught classes at the YMCA, for which there is documentation of his time there. Bacon also served as a bookkeeper for a large flour company. He worked as a clerk in the Department of Health and Charities, and before, worked for William Barnes and Co. At the time of the signing of the Eden Cemetery Company Charter, Bacon lived at 1[5]12 South 21st Street in

---

126 “Miss Marian Anderson Sings Rites for John C. Asbury,” The Afro-American, September 13, 1941.
130 The institute for Colored Youth has changed names through the century. It was subsequently known as the Cheyney State Normal School, Cheyney State Teachers College, Cheyney State College, and now is the Cheyney University of Pennsylvania. Jones is also unsure that Bacon was an educator at the Institute, although there is documentation that Bacon taught business subjects.
Philadelphia.131 He also owned a farm near Norristown, PA.132 He died in 1913 and like Asbury, was buried in the Celestine section of Eden (Fig. 32).

Charles W. Jones (1859(?)-1948(?)) was originally from Maryland (other reports says that he could have possibly been from Virginia). At the time of the signing of the Eden Cemetery Company Charter, Jones lived at 1735 Bainbridge Street in Philadelphia. In 1899, Jones worked as a broker before becoming one of Eden’s first vice presidents. In 1910, he sold real estate, and from 1919 to 1920, census records report that Jones made his living preaching. Currently, there is a memorial cenotaph marking the site of the grave purchased for his body in the Lebanon section (Fig. 33).133

Martin J. Lehmann (1858-1924) was a cigar manufacturer. Originally born in the Dutch West Indies, Lehmann learned his father’s trade at the age of fourteen years and shipped cigars until 1872 before coming to Philadelphia. He was the director of the People’s Saving Bank, while George Henry White was the president. At the time of his death, he was a director of Keystone Co-operative Banking Association, treasurer of Mercy Hospital, member of Society of St. Vincent de Paul; St. Mary’s Beneficial Society; West Indian Athlete Association; Holy Name Society, Sodality, and one of the founders of Peter Claver’s Church.134 Lehman served as manager of Eden until 1924 and was succeeded by his widow Erma C. Lehmann, who later became the treasurer. At the time of the signing of the Eden Cemetery Company Charter, Lehmann lived at 401 South Broad Street in Philadelphia. He is buried in the Lebanon section of Eden (Fig. 34).

Daniel W. Parvis (1839-1923)’s family had lived in Philadelphia since 1800, and a deed shows that the Parvis family owned property in Philadelphia since 1840.135 Parvis was chairman of the Corporate Board of Bethel Church in Philadelphia. Parvis was also a member of the Prince Hall

---

131 Brackets indicate the transcriber was unsure about the figure written.
133 It is unclear where Jones’ body was buried after he died, but there are no records stating that his body was buried in Eden. Jones.
Masons. Parvis’ Daughter, Katherine, or Katheryn in some reports, E. Parvis served as a director and corporate secretary of Eden from the 1930s until her death in 1980. The Katherine Parvis Gardens are named after her. At the time of the signing of the Eden Cemetery Company Charter, Parvis lived at [826] Lombard Street in Philadelphia. At the time of his death, Parvis was serving as Eden’s Vice President. He is buried in the Lebanon section of Eden (Fig. 35).

Due to the hard work of these five men, Eden Cemetery became a prominent fixture in the greater Philadelphia black community, while also continuing the legacy of affluent black businessman profiting from burial services, which was also seen at Lebanon and Olive in the nineteenth century. A 1926 Philadelphia Tribune article on the institution, made a record among Negro enterprises in Philadelphia, which has no equal for the punctuality in the performance of its duties, its successful management, the perfect keeping of its records and the profits made for its shareholders. Each shareholder has received in distributions many times the amount of his investment; this is the exception in race enterprises...[and] so perfect are the records that the resting place of any one of these can be located by grave, lot and section in the time it takes to open a book.136

Eden’s significance in the black community led many organizations to gather and help maintain the grounds beyond the work of the board members. By 1952, these organizations included the Masons, Elks, Odd Fellows, Cyrenes, the House of Refuge, British Great War Veterans and the Association for Colored Orphans in Philadelphia. Eden remained debt-free well into the mid-century.137 However, despite the relief the company had provided for the black community, rumors began to circulate that it was to be condemned, putting it in line for the same fate as Lebanon and Olive. A 1976 Philadelphia Tribune article gave credence to this theory by describing conditions that included “overturned graves” alleging that “motorcycles use [Eden] as a playground.”138 The Collingdale authorities assured residents that there were no motorcycle gangs terrorizing the cemetery and that

---

137 “Eden Cemetery Marks 50 Years of Historic Service to City,” The Philadelphia Tribune, Saturday, December 27, 1952.
Eden’s non-profit status protected it from condemnation. Eden, like Mount Zion and the Jewish cemeteries, Har Zion and Mount Lebanon, was tightly bounded by residential zones and continued to be well into the future due to its lawn-park cemetery design. Maintenance people at Eden believe that the residents living near Eden perceive it to be more in line with a public park than a private cemetery. This may account for the high level of vandalism present in the cemetery.

All in all, because of the work of Bacon, Asbury, Jones, Lehmann, and Parvis, Eden more than just “survived” into the twenty-first century. After a period of revival and restoration in late twentieth and twenty-first century, which involved renewed interest from community organizations and renovations that cemented the cemetery’s lawn-park design, Eden became a cultural institution that adapted to the needs and values of the twenty-first-century black community and became a prestigious site for the burial of other influential African-Americans, such as Christopher J. Perry, founder of the Philadelphia Tribune, and Marian Anderson, a well-known opera singer.

**Eden’s Historical Narrative Post-1902.**

Collingdale became the permanent home for the cemetery (Fig. 36), while the center of Philadelphia became the home of the cemetery’s offices for conducting business off of the property. The first location for the Eden Cemetery Company office was at 1332 Lombard Street in Philadelphia, which was also the private home of President Asbury, following the same model as Lebanon under the direction of Jacob C. White, Jr. The company office was then moved three more times to 1344 Lombard Street, 1504 South Street on the third floor of the Keystone Bank Building, and then finally to 501 South 16th Street on the second floor in 1928. Currently, the company occupies three rooms, two for office space and one for the cemetery officials. The company also has an administrative building located on the cemetery premises, where the managers receive people for burial serve appointments, and house the company records. A few of the original founding members’ family members had preceded them on the board, the most significant being Parvis’ daughter, Katherine. It is important to note that not only was Eden a legitimate business, but also an extremely
family oriented business, not just with the community, but also with those in charge of operating the company.

In 1908, the cemetery company sold the Bartram ancestral home and twenty-four acres of the original Thomas Bartram property to Mr. and Mrs. Harry L. Waters. The house was sold to a developer and demolished in 1969. In 1911, the receiving vault was built. Presently there are no records indicating specifically the process the cemetery went through in storing bodies before burial, but one theory from Jones is that the bodies could have been kept in stables next door in Mt. Zion, as was the case with the Celestine Cromwell burial. However, since this was the case with the bodies that would eventually end up in Mt. Zion, there is a possibility that bodies to be interred in Eden were also stored there. The vault is located underneath the John Brown section. This was typical of rural cemeteries and lawn-park cemeteries, as a place to keep bodies semi-preserved if the ground was too hard to break through for burial. Receiving vaults allowed cemetery companies to store bodies up until a certain time before the ground was malleable enough for burial. Typically, the use of receiving vaults ceased in the middle of the twentieth century, although it appears that Eden kept using its vault for a time after the 1950s.

In a Philadelphia Tribune newspaper from 1928 the cemetery company ran an advertisement for the costs of the lots in Eden’s sections stating:

> this cemetery contains enough Burial lots to accommodate all of Colored Philadelphia for the next Fifty years and is creating a Sinking Fund to purchase additional land when necessary. It is safe because

---

139 “Bartram House Sold to Developer”, Delaware County Daily Times, Tuesday, November, 18, 1969.
140 Currently, Kervin Barni, a graduate student at the University of Delaware, is working on a set of specification drawings for Eden’s receiving vault due to there being no records that exist of its spatial configurations past the 1950s.
141 An advertisement mentions the same facts about Eden, but includes more facts about Eden in direct response to the disbandment of Lebanon and Olive in Philadelphia: “The Eden Cemetery is located in Collingdale Borough, Delaware County. It contains fifty-three acres. It is large enough to contain the remains of all colored people who will die in Philadelphia and Vicinity in the next seventy-five years. It is entirely owned, controlled and managed by colored men and women and is PAID FOR IN FULL. It is the only Cemetery in the vicinity of Philadelphia in which colored people are buried that HAS NO MORTGAGE. It has a SINKING FUND in which is deposited a percentage of all receipts so that provision is being made for PERPETUAL CARE and the PURCHASE PRICE OR MORE GROUND when present Cemetery becomes full. It has a Receiving Vault that will accommodate ONE HOUNDRED AND FIFTY BODIES. Its walks and drives are concrete. Its employees are polite. Its service is always punctual and up-to-date. “Facts about Eden Cemetery,” The Philadelphia Tribune, November 27, 1926.
paid for. Don't fear losing your money or having to move your dead. Convenient to Philadelphia. Smooth Roads and Drives.\textsuperscript{142}

This newspaper advertisement is extremely significant because the Eden cemetery company was attempting to assuage the feelings of concern justified by the black community in the greater Philadelphia region due to the closures of Lebanon and Olive. In 1924, the mortgage was paid off in full,\textsuperscript{143} and in 1926, 32,000 people had been buried in Eden and in 1928, only one section of Eden had nearly been sold out and thirty acres (about 12,000 burial lots) had yet to be sold. In 1929, 12,000 burial lots were for sale. A lot in the Celestine section cost $106.50, a lot in the Lincoln section cost $96.50, and a lot in the David Bowser Section cost $76.50.\textsuperscript{144} The landscape of Eden also expanded in this year. The cemetery’s boundaries extended past Ash Avenue up to the present day Walnut Street, however, it is not completely clear from maps whether or not Eden extended up to Broad Street or Walnut Street. Ash Avenue is also shown to have cut through Eden, which accounts for the foot traffic between the cemetery and the residential zones, and may have led to the constant toppling of the headstones (Fig 37 - 39). In 1931, plans were drafted to erect a mausoleum in Eden (Fig. 40).\textsuperscript{145} The Eden Mausoleum Corporation, which was located on 250 South Broad Street in Philadelphia, contracted Claro Construction Company as the engineer and Oscar Schmidt as the architect. Between 1932-1933, the cemetery company contracted a project to build a stone gateway at Springfield Road, which is the present entrance to the cemetery, and carved on the gateway are the words: “Eden Memorial Park.” Jones believes that this name was only used for marketing purposes to sell the lawn-park design to the community. There are no features in Eden that indicate that the cemetery was “designed” as a memorial park, however.

\textsuperscript{143} “Eden Cemetery Marks 50 Years.”
\textsuperscript{144} “For Sale: Twelve Thousand Burial Lots in Eden Cemetery,” \textit{The Philadelphia Tribune}, January 24, 1929. Exclusive grave prices include Celestine Section, Adults $55.00, Children over one month $47.00, Children one month and under $44.00, Lincoln Section, Adults $50.00, Children over one month $42.00, Children one month and under $39.00, David Bowser Section, Adults $45.00 Children over one month $37.00, and Children one month and under $34.00.
\textsuperscript{145} References in newspaper articles that the Eden Mausoleum would be the first above ground interment for African-Americans in the United States.
Before the 1940s, Eden Cemetery and Mount Zion Cemetery were separated by Bartram Avenue which ran uninterrupted from Sharon Avenue to Springfield Road. Also up to the 1940s, Eden was separated into two halves by the now non-existent Felton Avenue.\footnote{Insurance Maps and Real Estate Atlas, Sanborn, 1940.} Insurance maps also show the lack of housing and building development around Eden and Mount Zion, which would change in the late twentieth and twenty-first centuries as Collingdale grew (Fig. 41 - 42) In 1950, the receiving vault was renovated.\footnote{Source: Kevin Barni, University of Delaware.} By 1952, (there were 59,600 burials recorded at this time) Eden was divided into eighteen sections and by the twenty-first century, there were twenty-three sections. The first section in use for burial was the John Brown section, which was in use heavily from 1902 to approximately 1950, then burials tapered. Other early sections include the Celestine section, the Home section, the Lebanon section, the Lincoln section, the Tubman section. Lincoln was only used for a few graves in the beginning of the cemetery’s history and burials appeared in Tubman first in 1906.\footnote{Barni.} From a Philadelphia tribune article on the twenty-six anniversary of Eden in 1952, the landscape is described as, “conveniently situated and beautiful in contour, consisting in three high rolling stretches having a natural drainage with no flat surface and therefore free from watery graves which many cemeteries have.”\footnote{“Eden Cemetery Co. Celebrates Its 26th Anniversary,” \textit{The Philadelphia Tribune}, Thursday, September 27, 1928.}

In 1972, a new building was built for administrative purposes (Fig. 43 – 46), and by 1974, 60,000 people had been interred in Eden.\footnote{Eden Cemetery,” Nomination of Eden Cemetery for the National Register of Historic Places, October 18, 2010.} By 1976, with its neighbor Mt. Zion, was bounded by a 40-acre recreation area, which was bounded by a wooded area.\footnote{“Eden Cemetery Never ‘Condemned,” \textit{The Philadelphia Tribune}, Saturday, May 29, 1976.} Due to the rough appearance of all four cemeteries in Collingdale, resulting from local youths riding their motorbikes on the grounds, people believed that the cemeteries were subjects of constant vandalism and that Eden was closing due to its rough exterior appearance. However, in a \textit{Tribune} article, the Police Chief stated that the police department had cracked down on cemetery vandals about fifteen to eighteen years ago and
outlawed biker gangs. In 1980, 200 bodies were discovered during the digging for the Center City Commuter Tunnel. Archaeologists found eighty-nine intact skeletons and pieces of bone that were dated from 1824 to 1841. The remains found showed traces of West African and European traditions of burial typically associated with blacks in the nineteenth century. In 1990, an earlier burial site was discovered during the construction of the Vine Street Expressway and 135 intact skeletons were found, buried from 1810 to 1824. After examination from the Smithsonian, the remains were buried in Eden in the 1980s and the 1990s.

Lots for churches include the first African Presbyterian, Central Presbyterian, Wesley, AMEZ, Grace Union AME, St. Thomas P. E. St Marks P. E., Church of the Crucifixion, St. Mary’s P.E., Union Baptist, Church of God and Saints of Christ and St. Simon the Cyrenian. In reference to rampant vandalism issues, according to Mina Cockroft, “Eden is caught in the middle of a playground and a residential area. It is convenient for them to go through Eden and as a result of the trespassing you have vandalism that has occurred.” Currently the cemetery is facing economic issues due to more people choosing cremation over traditional burials, as well as African-Americans adopting more contemporary means of memorializing the dead that do not involve grave burial. Also the cemetery is facing competition from cemeteries that have historically disbarred African-Americans, but are now accepting all people for burying. Eden is also running out of space for burials. The company has sold, for the past five years, about fifty to seventy graves annually, which would keep the cemetery in business for about five more years. There is space to expand on the rest of the property, but new graves will only be made if there is demand. Current interests in turning Eden into an historic center for visitors is currently one of the solutions to decline in revenue and grave availability. The government purchased a plot in the Lebanon section for soldiers who had died during the Civil War, and there are about one hundred African-American Civil War soldiers buried in

152 “Eden Cemetery Marks 50 Years.”
Eden. The Eden Cemetery Company has also received a grant from the Pennsylvania Society to erect stones on unmarked graves. A few prominent African-Americans have unmarked graves, including Jerome Bacon.

Eden is also part of the National Underground Railroad Network to Freedom. The cemetery is now being referred to as the Historic Eden Cemetery, which takes into account the archival nature and level of history the cemetery has to offer as the company shifts towards educating the public about Eden’s significance with African-American burial sites in Philadelphia. To educate the public, the current cemetery company has scheduled Civil War tours, community cleanups, created and screened a documentary about Eden’s history. Due to this work of the Eden Cemetery Company and the amount of history archived in Eden, the best approach to safeguarding the cemetery’s heritage would be a cultural landscapes report that takes into consideration the significance of Eden’s placement within the historical narrative of African-American burial sites as well as the capacity of the site’s ability to change over time, naturally and culturally. The following chapter describes the method for completing such a report.

Chapter Four: Cultural Landscape Management Plan for Eden Cemetery

Given the richness and complexity of not only Eden’s historical narrative, but also its cultural legacy, how do we create a preservation management plan that celebrates and preserves its valued heritage? One way lies in how contemporary African-American historians and architects have begun to think about representing “blackness” in their work. In the Crisis of the African-American Architect, Melvin Mitchell paints a manifesto for representing “blackness” in future architecture. He

---

154 Kristin E. Holmes, “Collingdale Cemetery Plans a New Life as Historic Site,” March 18, 2011.
includes a passage from a speech by Department of Architecture and City Planning Chair Hilyard Robinson at Howard University:

The culture conditions that produced black musical genius has also already produced black architectural genius. Acquiring the confidence to proclaim that genius through analysis and scholarship is the task at hand today for the next generation of designer-scholars.

Art is by definition a process of stylization; and what it objectifies, embodies, abstracts, expresses, and symbolizes is a sense of life... Accordingly, what is represented in music, dance, painting, sculpture, literature of a given group of people in a particular time, place, and circumstance is a conception of the essential nature and purpose of human existence itself.

Keeping this quotation in mind, how do we establish a preservation plan that stylistically “embodies” and “expresses” the African-American experience with death up to the founding of Eden Cemetery? Francaviglia uses the term “necrography” to accentuate the relationship of architecture or, in the case of Eden Cemetery, landscapes to sociology, psychology, and economics of a group of people. “Necrography”, in relation to Eden, is used to describe the characteristics of African-American burial landscapes in Philadelphia before 1902, where many sites were condemned based partly on discrimination against African-Americans, as well as city growth. The nineteenth-century African-American community constantly searched for some semblance of dignity and respect in burial, which was afforded to them in a few churchyards. These burial sites managed to stand the test of time similar to the Eden, Lebanon, and Olive cemeteries before closing in the early twentieth century.

---

155 Emphasized by thesis author.
157 Francaviglia, 501.
158 Although Lebanon and Olive represented a new step in the “color line” of burial services for African-Americans in 1849, Eden is considered to be the successor to these sites since it has retained its integrity as a cemetery, while these nineteenth century cemeteries were disbanded.
century. Wallace notes that cultural landscapes “provide both physical and cultural context for buildings or sites that might otherwise appear *insignificant.*”\(^{159}\) Although the social dynamics of African-American structures and landscapes are changing, the stigma of appearing “insignificant” in pre-Eden, as well as pre-1849, burial sites comes from the lack of knowledge of their cultural factors and physical features. Due to its current look and issues with maintenance, Eden also falls into this category of appearing insignificant. However, professionals should take care in considering the historical legacy of Eden as its basis for being a valued heritage site. African-American burial landscapes are “*storehouses*”\(^{160}\) of African-American history, and Eden represents a specific type of storehouse in which displaced graves and Eden “citizen” stories are retained. What makes Eden significant is that it is a “cemetery of cemeteries.”\(^{161}\) According to Jones, in response to why Eden is nationally significant, she states that Eden,

> holds the stories of African-Americans who have shaped the course of the history of the Philadelphia region, of Pennsylvania, and of the United States as individuals and through organizations during slavery, reconstruction, equal rights, segregation, desegregation and civil rights. Eden holds the stories of persons involved in the Revolutionary War up to and including the Vietnam War. Eden holds the stories of individuals and organizations that have shaped arts, education, entertainment, law, medicine, politics and religion, locally, regionally, statewide, and nationally. As such, Eden Cemetery would seem to be not only of local and regional significance but also of statewide and national significance as is the Eden Cemetery, stewards of material culture, of ancestral monuments, and of this library and museum.\(^{162}\)

---

\(^{159}\) Emphasized by thesis author.

\(^{160}\) “Grave Matters, The Preservation of African-American Cemeteries.”

\(^{161}\) Jones.

\(^{162}\) Email exchange between Jones and Karen Galie on applying Eden for an Historical Marker Nomination. July 16th, 2012.
A cultural landscapes report (CLR) needs to take into consideration the significance of these values of displacement and unification, religion, and racial politics that have been collected and stored within Eden’s burial landscape.

**Cultural Landscape Management Plan for Eden Cemetery.**

Considering the changes already in progress in Eden’s natural and cultural landscape, a CLR would provide support for long-term management and treatment plans. This will be useful with current interpretative projects such as a proposal to convert the receiving vault into a museum and a proposal for a memorial garden. The scope of work for the CLR includes the significance of the site, the issues to be addressed, the values attributed to the site, the process for how the report was constructed, and the format of the document. The purpose of this particular CLR is to provide the current Eden Cemetery Company with a compiled source of historical information about Eden as well as to serve as a reference for current projects, such as amending the 2010 National Register Nomination for Eden and nominating Eden for National Landmark Status. The issues concerning this report are assessing the cultural and natural heritage resources of Eden, creating new ways the cemetery company could use Eden as a teaching tool to inform the community about African-American burial landscapes, and establishing a management plan to be applied to other black burial sites. Considering the limited amount of time and the interests of this thesis, this CLR will only focus on investigating the socio-cultural values of the site, natural resources that could be surveyed without the use of extensive surveying equipment, and creating a management plan that could be used for further research and investigation in Eden.
The process for creating this CLR involved researching the current scholarship on African-American burial landscapes, analyzing the evolution of black burial sites in Philadelphia and their connections to one another through the displacement of churchyards and graveyards, and the unification of these sites in Lebanon and Olive in 1849 and eventually in Eden in 1902. I reconstructed the early history of Eden Cemetery, since this has not been recorded in a linear form or taken into account its significance regarding the displacement and unification of burial sites in Philadelphia, as well as being the only available place of burial for blacks larger than a churchyard at that time. I assessed the cultural and natural heritage values of Eden, which include the adaption of the lawn-park cemetery design, creation of “blackness” in the cemetery sections, retention of graves of influential African-Americans, significantly those from the nineteenth-century, and Eden’s survival into the twentieth-first century. The format of this report consists of two parts: part one will reiterate briefly the site history Eden, as well as analyze and evaluate the existing conditions of the cemetery. And part two includes the treatment plan and discusses the current and future intangible values of Eden.

*Site Boundaries and Summary of Findings.*

Eden is bounded by Springfield Road in the east, Mount Zion Methodist Meeting Cemetery to the south, and twentieth-century residential and commercial buildings located to the west on Sharon Avenue and to the north on Westmont Drive. (Fig. 47) New findings from this report include Eden’s relationship to the historical narrative of displaced African-American burial landscapes in Philadelphia, the emotional and political stake the black community had in the creation of Eden, the amount of influential African-Americans buried there currently, and the projects that
the cemetery company is currently working on to preserve the legacy of Eden after the cemetery reaches capacity. These projects include an interpretive center in the receiving vault, a memorial garden, the Friends of Eden Cemetery, the “Bench by the Road” project (Fig. 48 - 49), “Days of Service”, “Hallowed Grounds ” project, and mapping “Citizens of Eden”, which has a list of “notables” buried at Eden. Site visits and observations also revealed that there is work to be done with correcting section marker names (specifically the Bowers Section Marker) and lot board section orientations (Fig. 50 - 65). The cemetery is also in need of more maintenance, due to landscaping issues, such as uneven plots. This is a natural occurrence in cemeteries, but the excessive level of unevenness in Eden is due to the low level of maintenance. The landscaping issues are also attributed to the lack of vaults used for earlier burials, which has led to massive sink holes around the property. Overgrown edges along with disturbed headstones and markers are also significant landscape markings. (Fig. 66 - 71). Additionally, none of the original Bartram Family structures, including the farm house, remain standing.163

Part One: Site History Brief and Existing Conditions Evaluated.

African-American burial landscapes’ cultural significance begins with the creolization of West African and European burial traditions, seen initially in slave graveyards and continued in black cemetery designs of the nineteenth century. African-American burial landscapes from the nineteenth century, such as churchyards and the larger non-sectarian public cemeteries, provided the basis for suburban cemeteries such as Eden to become completely autonomous institutions where the black

163 Jones.
community could bury their dead with dignity, which was first fought for in petitioning to section off Philadelphia’s potter’s fields in the eighteenth century. This complex history defines the cultural landscape of African-American burial traditions and services. Cultural landscapes are typically divided into four categories, and Eden is defined by two: it is an ethnographic as well as an historic vernacular landscape. An ethnographic landscape is “a landscape containing a variety of natural and cultural resources that associated people define as heritage resources.” Eden is a landscape that contains natural heritage resources exhibited in the use of lawn-park cemetery designs adapted by African-Americans and the cultural heritage resources exhibited in the significance of a privately owned institution by a minority group, as well the unification of disbanded burial sites in Philadelphia. For this report, an ethnographic landscape study includes documentation of the development of African-American burial sites in Philadelphia and their unification in Eden, creolization of African-American burial culture, the work of significant African-Americans and their role in the creation/continuation of Eden. Ethnography allows us to look at the diversity of cultural resources Eden provides for not only the local black community, but also all Americans. An historic vernacular landscape is defined as, “a landscape whose use, construction, or physical layout reflects endemic traditions, customs, beliefs, or values; expresses cultural values, social behavior, and individual actions over time…” Eden cemetery’s landscape is a direct reflection of African-

---

164 Although defining the type of cultural landscape for the site is standard for cultural landscape reports, Eden cemetery, such as other sites of a similar kind do not fit “neatly” within a single definition. This report may also function as an example for how we may edit the current standards to include “non-traditional” places such as Eden.


166 Page, Gilbert, and Dolan.
American burial landscapes where it reflects the African-American experience with death and a lawn-park developed into burial sections venerating those who have advanced the cause of African-American civil rights. Eden displays “blackness” in spatial organization and design, but this “blackness” has been developed over time as African-Americans have responded to the situation of the “color line” in burial by phasing out family groupings once used in churchyards and potter’s fields. Famous African-Americans, either from Philadelphia or who have had an impact on city, are buried in Eden adding a layer of cultural and historical patina to the legacy of Eden in the form of “citizens” collected in a single unified place.


Eden cemetery represents survival influenced by the African-American experience with death. Eden represents the African-American community adapting their creolized heritage in burial to American trends in burial sites. I believe this is important to the survival of Eden because it resembles a place of burial that is recognizable to people outside of the African-American community, yet we should not disregard the importance of earlier black burial sites that seemed to appear “disorganized” and “non-traditional” in the European-American sense of burial organization/design. Eden is the next step in the evolution of African-American burial culture, which is a culture shaped by adaptation and creativity in forms. The land transaction for Eden Cemetery is important since it marks a significant legal struggle the founders faced in purchasing land for specific African-American use, as well as the presence of Quaker s in Collingdale, which allowed for blacks to gain opportunities for social space that would have been denied by the white community. The fact that the founders were only able to purchase land for Eden due to the efforts of Quaker s demonstrates the struggle the black community still faced in the twentieth century in acquiring land
for burial purposes. In short, Eden is the direct and indirect response to the dominate culture of nineteenth and twentieth century Philadelphia. The values of the black community at the time Eden was established included an urge to save their burial landscapes, fight for dignity in death, and create a community institution specific for African-American needs. The most recognizable theme of being “black” in America exhibited in Eden is its solution for a community that constantly battled discrimination based on race, as well as solving the issue of land large enough to accept condemned burial sites. Yet a subtle aspect of the “blackness” of Eden resonates in the veneration of not only African-Americans who advanced the cause of civil rights for blacks, but also other non-black Americans who were integral in the struggle, including John Brown and Abraham Lincoln. I believe this is act of reverence and the adaption of lawn-park cemetery design represents what it means to be “black” in America when it comes to burial, demonstrating the culture to be a mixture of other cultures, beliefs, and designs that make up the African-American experience.

*Eden’s Site Organization.*

Eden’s landscape design, although not the creation of a professional landscaping firm or architect, is indicative of the importance of African-American burial customs and cultural, social, and political values. Eden is divided up into twenty-three sections (Fig. 72), from southwest to northeast:

- **Catto “A” and Catto “B”** (Fig. 73 - 76): named after Octavius V. Catto. Catto (1839-1870) was a civil rights leader, as well as an athlete, who worked with the Republican Party in Philadelphia to gain civil liberties for blacks, including the right to vote. Catto was buried in

---

167 According to Jones, the current cemetery staff has no knowledge of how the cemetery was initially laid out in 1902.  
168 St. Thomas Churchyard was reserved a section of its own within a larger section, which has been kept more or less intact.
Lebanon Cemetery, and his grave was reinterred in Eden in 1903. His grave was dedicated in the Lebanon section of Eden with a memorial headstone in 2007 (Fig. 77).169

- **David Bowser** (Fig. 78 - 79): named after David Bustill Bowser. Bowser (1820-1900) was a painter, who was best known for his portraits of Abraham Lincoln and painted flags for African-American Civil War troops.170 Bowser was originally buried in Lebanon Cemetery and his grave was moved to the Lebanon section of Eden.

- **Lehmann** (Fig. 80 - 81): named after Martin J. Lehmann. Notable African-Americans buried in this section include Julian Abele, an African-American architect who contributed to the designs of the Philadelphia Museum of Art and the Free Library of Philadelphia (Fig. 82).

- **Richard Allen** (Fig. 83 – 84): Allen (1760-1831) is buried in the lower level of Mother A.M.E. Church.171 Notable African-Americans buried in this section include Arizona Cleaver Stemmons who was the founder of the Zeta Phi Beta Sorority (Fig. 85 - 86).

- **Tubman** (Fig. 87 - 88): named after Harriet Tubman. Notable African-Americans buried in this section include Robert Penn, who was a recipient of a Congressional Medal of Honor for his service during the Spanish American War (Fig. 89).

- **Bowers** (Fig. 90 - 91): named after John C. Bowers. Bowers (1811-1873) was originally buried in Lebanon Cemetery and his grave was moved to Lebanon section of Eden next to Catto’s grave.

---

169 Catto’s grave was one of the many graves reinterred in Eden in 1902 that did not have a marker.


171 Mother Bethel A.M.E. is one of the few African-American churches with corresponding churchyards for burying still intact in Philadelphia.
- **Lebanon** (Fig. 92-93): named after Lebanon Cemetery. Notable African-Americans buried in this section include William Still (Fig. 94), abolitionist and Underground Railroad agent, Absalom Jones 172 (Fig. 95), and Elizabeth and Hiram Montier, a couple of African descent, who became subjects of rare portraits from the colonial area with ties to Philadelphia’s first mayor, Humphrey Morrey (Fig. 96). The columns in the Lebanon section are from the abandoned cemetery.

- **Letson-Martin** (Fig. 97-98): named after Albert Letson, who was a President of Eden after Asbury, and Maximilian Martin, a treasurer of Eden.

- **John Brown** (Fig. 99-100): named after the American abolitionist John Brown. Notable African-Americans buried in this section include Frances Ellen Watkins Harper who was a poet and a novelist (Fig. 101).

- **Douglass “A”, “B”, “C”, “D”, and “E”** (Fig. 102-111): named after Frederick Douglass. Notable African-Americans buried in this section include Tyrone “The Mean Machine” Everett, who was a famous boxer from South Philadelphia (Fig. 112).

- **Daniel Parvis** (Fig. 113-114): named after Daniel W. Parvis.

- **Lincoln** (Fig. 115-116): named after Abraham Lincoln.

- **Home** (Fig. 117-118): named after Stephen Smith’s Home for the Aged and Infirm Colored Persons (now called the Stephen Smith Home) burial ground. Stephen Smith (1795-

---

172 Absalom Jones’ headstone (cenotaph) was donated by the Prince Hall Masons, but his name is spelled incorrectly and the date of his death is also incorrect. His ashes were reinterred from Eden to the African Episcopal Church of St. Thomas in 1992. Disinterment was performed by the Clarence M. Wood Funeral Home, 5537036 West Girard Avenue. There is a monument dedicated to his memory at St. Paul's on Lancaster and Overbrook Avenue. “Absalom Jones ‘comes home’ to St. Thomas,” *The Philadelphia Tribune*, November 10, 1992.
1873) was a one of the wealthiest African-Americans living in the state of Pennsylvania in the nineteenth century.\textsuperscript{173} Smith like other well-to-do African-Americans at this time, such as Jacob C. White, Sr., found financial success through the cemetery business. Smith was originally buried in Olive Cemetery, however his grave was moved to the Celestine section when both the Home and Olive cemetery graves were reinterred in Eden (Fig. 119).

- **Olive** (Fig. 120 - 121): named after Olive Cemetery.

- **Celestine, Celestine Reserve #1 and Reserve #2** (Fig. 122 - 127): named after Celestine Cromwell. Notable people buried in this section, besides Asbury, Bacon and Smith, include Reginald Bryant (Fig. 128), George Henry White (Fig. 129), Charles Tindley (Fig. 130), Christopher Perry (Fig. 131), and Marian Anderson (Fig. 132). Celestine is highly regarded as the most prestigious section of Eden due to its historic connections to its founding.

- **Katherine Parvis Gardens** (Fig. 133 - 134): Named after Katherine Parvis.

Since 1952, recent improvements in the cemetery landscape include relaying the main road into the cemetery and constructing a new bridge. The cemetery company added additional lawn-park features, which included paving paths and landscaping the creek that runs through the property (Fig. 135 - 139). The creek also runs through the property owned by Mount Zion Meeting Cemetery. The receiving vault was also remodeled in the 1950s (Fig. 140 - 144). There was also a new sidewalk paved on Springfield Road, which spanned the entire cemetery front. A statement written by an unknown cemetery official concludes that Eden,

\[ \text{...began with a horse and cart on the grounds, shovels and picks. Now [a] jeep, gang-mower, tractor, carts, bull-dozer, chapel tent, chairs, grass rugs, cocoa walks, chimes play accompanying each} \]

funeral processional; and all modern devices used in the service of funerals.

In private graves, a lot has the capacity to hold up to nine people and each grave usually holds two to three people. Some of these private graves are only for single burials. Eden’s public graves have the capacity to hold many more graves. A lot is approximately ten feet wide and eight feet long.

**Part Two: Treatment Plan – Assessing the Current and Future Intangible Values of Eden Cemetery.**

Eden Cemetery represents a type of African-American burial landscape in which the black community continued to gain respect and space to adequately bury their dead and relief for condemned burial sites. The prehistory of Eden is extremely significant because it provides the reason for why Eden was established initially, it being the only large burying site for condemned graves as well as becoming the “collector site” of community memory, history, and physical elements of disbanded burial sites. The history of Eden is partly seen in the burial sections which represent the history of disbanded burial sites, and in the grave headstones, which show the history of a specific grave, especially if the grave had been moved at least once. Therefore, the type of treatment plan applicable for Eden’s values conservation is rehabilitation, where change in the physical and cultural features of the cemetery are accepted, paving the way for possible new uses for the cemetery, such as an historic museum when the grave capacity is filled. Work will also include actively preserving the historical narrative of African-American landscapes, Eden’s own specific history, the legacy of the founders, and Eden’s landscape evolution. The cemetery needs constant repair as tombstones are

---

174 Jones. Exact number unknown.
damaged easily due close proximity to streets and residential zones. Also, site features, such as the receiving vault, need to be repurposed in order to keep up regular maintenance. This treatment will follow the standards laid out for rehabilitation of cultural landscapes, but will hone in on one common feature seen in African-American burial sites, rampant damage or destruction due to appearing insignificant, which is a constant struggle the maintenance staff is currently experiencing with Eden. Although Eden has not faced the level of damaged other black burial sites have faced in the past, it is important to include the possibility of Eden facing some sort of disrepair in the future. The historical character will be maintained, but efforts should be taken to repair any part of the landscape that has been unintentionally or intentionally damaged. Another piece of this treatment plan amending the 2010 National Register Nomination to include accurate historical information about Eden and its significance in African-American burial landscape history.

**Possible Forms of Interpretation and Education for Eden.**


- Compiling a list of sources the cemetery company could use to reference the creation and history of the cemetery.

- A brochure stating the significance of each of the burial sections, accompanied with a walking tour.

- Mapping the remainder of the graves in the cemetery to complete the historical narrative of the displaced African-American burial landscapes.
• Surveying the site to provide the cemetery company with documentation to better assist them with maintaining graves and the physical features of the site.

• Continuing the current cemetery practices of erecting monuments to certain sites that have a specific place in African-American history (Fig. 145).

Some projects currently being pursued by the cemetery company include:

• A “virtual cemetery” online media presence for Eden, including poetry posts from the community.

• An outdoor classroom in the Lincoln section.

• A children’s garden in the Tubman section.

• Audio self-guided tours.

• Reenactments of the baseball team, the Pythians, which was a team many prominent African-Americans were a part of in the nineteenth century, including Catto.

• Documentation of all of the graves to hopefully establish markers for unmarked lots.

• Outdoor sculpture park.

Conclusion

In order to create preservation plans that incorporate the cultural and historical significance of African-American burial landscapes, preservationists should utilize various types of African-American burial sites, such as Eden Cemetery, to fully comprehend the cultural factors behind their landscape organization, geographical location, and historical significance. Treating these sites as individual cultural landscapes will allow professionals to generate management reports that take into
account the socio-cultural values as well as burial landscape design and organization that has been adapted by the African-American community and manifested into sites such as Eden Cemetery, which incorporates elements from the lawn-park cemetery movement. These individual cultural landscapes should also be recognized as interconnected elements of a wider cultural narrative of the African-American experience with death and should be handled as repositories of memory, where cultural factors are manifested in physical form. Since many of these sites, especially those from the nineteenth-century, function as the only place where a black identity could be maintained, treating them as a piece of a larger narrative will help to define the African-American experience with death. Although the preservation field is shifting toward creating management plans that take into account the socio-cultural values of cultural landscapes, this report may help to push professionals to fully engage the ethnographic landscape and cultural factors that may indirectly or directly inform a building or landscape, how and why the particular structure was conceived.

The African-American burial cultural landscape is a direct and indirect result of the figurative and literal movement exhibited in African-American celebrations, particularly the celebration of someone’s life once they have passed, and the effects of discrimination and segregation that led to the creation of Eden after black-only cemeteries and churchyards were condemned by the city. The Black Church also shaped the African-American experience with death, which has now become the “second great act” of life that is now embraced instead of feared. Also the influence of the Black Church has given vibrancy to the phrase, “doin’ it up right”, where any important event is a reason to celebrate and venerate a person with great fanfare. Racial politics provided the basis for de jure as well as de facto segregation where blacks were only allowed to be buried in certain areas, or created their own places of burial in the form of churchyards or suburban cemeteries such as Eden. From these three factors of the African-American experience, the evolution of black burial sites is given significant meaning, which informs their direct relationship with the formation of Eden, which was a response to the plight of the African-American community living in Philadelphia at the turn of the
century, who was denied the same funerary rights as other Americans. Reconstructing Eden’s historical origins, post-1902 historical narrative, and landscape design/organization was also researched because of the lack of a coherent and referenced history in recent reports that do not take into consideration Jerome Bacon’s reason for founding Eden as well as its important place in the black community in the twentieth century. From newspaper articles, especially, Eden was highly regarded as a place of importance for African-Americans because of its ability to survive for more than a century and the possibility of dignity in death that was not given to them with the legacy of slave graveyards and potter’s fields, but began with Lebanon, Olive, and churchyards. We need to develop preservation management plans that are culturally sensitive to the African-American experience with death, using the historical and cultural significance of Eden as a lens to understand the narrative of displacement as well as unification in African-American burial history.

My major research findings and thoughts on this thesis include cultural and historical points that have not been fully realized relative to the significance of Eden. This was brought out by researching the cultural and historical significance of the African-American burial landscape within the historical narrative of the African-American experience and stating Eden’s legacy as part of the larger narrative of African-American burial site displacement that began with slave graveyards and the black-only sections of the Philadelphia’s potter’s fields. Research also uncovered another piece of Eden’s significance, as the figurative and literal repository of Philadelphia’s African-American burial landscapes. Reading this cemetery landscape, as well as other African-American burial types, will allow preservationists the opportunity to consider cultural and historic factors, the legacy of Philadelphia’s black community, and its response to burial ground displacement, which makeup Eden’s significance as well as the significance of African-American burial landscapes as a whole. Eden demonstrates continuity between the African-American experience with death in general, the evolution of black burial sites in Philadelphia, and how these two events led to the creation of rural and suburban cemeteries that responded to the eminent needs of the black community.
Although this is a preservation thesis focusing on the cultural landscape thinking in cemeteries, other aspects that are not necessarily considered a part of architectural and landscape architectural history should be further investigated, hopefully using this thesis as a guideline for either expanding upon Eden Cemetery’s history or reconstructing the history of another African-American burial site. Further areas of research include expanding upon the legacies of the Lebanon and Olive Cemetery. While researching for Eden, I was surprised by the lack of material for Olive Cemetery, which was owned by a prominent African-American, Stephen Smith. There has been substantial research done on Lebanon compared to Olive which may be due to its last manager Jacob C. White, Jr. and the medical school “body snatching” scandal. Developing the social connection between the five founders of Eden and their professional activities presents another possibly future area of research. Part of Eden’s significance lies in its relation to these men who appear to have had quite an influence on the African-American community, yet the amount of scholarship investigating their lives is lacking. Also investigating Merion Cemetery’s relationship with the nineteenth-century Philadelphia black community is another possible avenue for future research. Merion seemed to have some significance with the nineteenth-century black community due to it being mentioned in DuBois’s 1899 study and the documents showing a negotiation between the managers of Merion with White, Jr. over possibly re-interring bodies from Lebanon to Merion before it was closed in 1901. I think it would be worthwhile to further investigate the Eden Mausoleum Corporation and the story about the mausoleum that was to be erected in Eden. Finally, investigating precedent studies on how to “convert” full cemeteries into research or interpretive centers is another area that may be helpful to preserve the legacy of burial sites such as Eden when they reach their capacity and the cemetery company needs another source of revenue.

I discovered that Eden derives its significance from being the only available place for condemned black sites in the vicinity of Philadelphia at the turn of the twentieth century, outside of churchyards. The cemetery establishment is attributed to the efforts of those who continued the
legacy of the black community in Philadelphia creating respected places of burial, which was first fought for in condemned sites such as Lebanon Cemetery and Olive Cemetery, the black churchyards, and the city’s potter’s fields. As a contribution to the field of preservation, I believe Eden’s historical significance and the values it represents offers a new perspective on new modes of preservation. As David Brown, Executive Vice President and Chief Preservation Officer for the National Trust for Historic Preservation, once stated, speaking of heritage conservation, “what does the community see as significant?” How do we incorporate the values of a place that are not necessarily visible to professionals, but important to the community? Therein lies the challenge of preserving sites such as Eden, where traditional methods of preservation do not apply and ultimately prevent these sites from being fully protected. These sites and their management plans could support a change in which we transform our tools and methods to embrace change and the community memory present in non-traditional heritage sites.
Bibliography

*Eden Cemetery.*


“Asbury Wants to Get Into His Eden: Another Chapter in the Collingdale Cemetery Case, Suit For Alleged Trespass. President of the Colored Burial Ground Begins Action Against J.W. Simpson Because Interment was Refused to the Body of a Colored Man in a Cemetery Chartered by the Court.” *The Delaware County Times.* Thursday, August 14, 1902.


Cemeteries, certain locations prohibited; Exemptions, 158 § 1, 1902.

“Cemetery Notes.” *Park and Cemetery and Landscape Gardening (1900-1931).* November 1, 1902.


*Charter of the Eden Cemetery Company.* June 20, 1902.

*Charter of the Eden Cemetery Company (Revised).* August 6, 1902.

“Chester.” *Wilkes Barre Time,* Saturday. August 16, 1902.

“The Collingdale Case.” *The Delaware County Times.* Thursday, August 14, 1902.

“Collingdale Cemetery Plans a New Life as Historic site.” *Philly.com.*

Tuesday, January 29,1985.


“Eden Cemetery.” USGenArchives.net.


“The Eden Cemetery: Too Much Doubt in the Case to Continue the Injunction.” Delaware County Daily Times, October, 14, 1902.


Holmes Kristin E. “Collingdale Cemetery Plans a New Life as Historic Site.” March 18, 2011.


“Martin J. Lehmann, Useful Citizen and Business Man, Dead.” The Philadelphia Tribune, March 8th, 1924.

“Miss Marian Anderson Sings Rites for John C. Asbury.” The Afro-American. September 13, 1941.


“Perpetually Enshrined: Every man should give serious thought to the important duty of choosing a final resting place for departed loved ones.” The Philadelphia Tribune, Thursday, March 19th, 1931.


“Removing the Bodies.” Delaware County Daily Times, Chester, Pennsylvania, Thursday April 30, 1903.

“A Startling Query: President Asbury Wants to Know if Collingdale Wants Dead Niggers or Live Ones.” Delaware County Daily Times, August 22, 1902.


Topics in Cemetery Cultural Landscape Thinking.


Robinson, Timothy Mark. “Postmodern Negotiations and the Ancestral Presence in African
Urban and Rural African-American Burial Sites.


African-American Burial Customs.


Davidson, James M. “Keeping the Devil at Bay: The Shoe on the Coffin Lid and Other Grave


**American Burial Sites.**


**African-American Culture.**


**Maps.**

*Collingdale Borough, Delaware County.* Prepared by Pennsylvania Department of Transportation, Bureau of Planning and Research Geographic Information Division, 2010.

*Map of Darby Borough (Collingdale), 1892*

*Map of Land owned by Thomas Bartram before Eden purchase, 1892.*

*The Seventh Ward of Philadelphia: The Distribution of Negro Inhabitants throughout the Ward, and Their Social Condition, 1899.*
Appendix 1 Figures
Figure 1 - A small cemetery for African slaves and free black New Yorkers developed along the southern edge of Collect Pond. Source: Preserve America.
Figure 2 - A 1904 map showing the Quaker and African American cemeteries after the Zoo acquired part of the African American burial ground, Washington D.C. Source: The Walter Pierce Park Cemeteries.
Figure 3 - Mt. Pisgah African Methodist Episcopal Churchyard, Landslide Township, Camden, New Jersey. Source: Yankee Cemetery.
Figure 4 - “Chapel of the Lebanon Cemetery” by G. Dubois, 1850. Source: The Library Company of Philadelphia.
Figure 5 - View of the entrance to Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 6 - Overview of Eden Cemetery, Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 7 - Overview of Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 8 - Unmarked graves, African American section, Henry family cemetery, Asheville, NC. Photo Credit: Cornelia Henry.
Figure 9 - View of the Woodlands Cemetery in Philadelphia, established in 1840. The Woodlands represents the “traditional” organization of the European-American burial landscape that would not be seen in African-American burial sites until the formation of rural cemeteries such as Lebanon and Olive Cemeteries in 1849. Also the Woodlands is an excellent example of a rural cemetery, which juxtaposes Eden’s lawn-park cemetery design. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 10 - 1862 Smedley map of Olive Cemetery and the cemetery attached to the Catholic Church Our Mother of Sorrows (labeled in this map as Cathedral Cemetery). Although Our Mother of Sorrows’ present congregation is predominantly African-American, in the nineteenth century the church served a mostly Irish population. This map is meant to show the separation in burial between black and whites. Olive was one of the only places blacks were allowed burial services in Philadelphia at this time. Source: Samuel L. Smedley Map, Phil Geo History.
Figure 11 - A funeral procession in Monroe, Georgia, for George Dorsey and Dorothea Dorsey Malcolm, who were lynched in 1946. Source: Bettmann/CORBIS.
Figure 12 - Section of the Map of the Seventh Ward of Philadelphia, 1899. “W.E.B. Du Bois conducted his pioneering sociological study, The Philadelphia Negro, in the Seventh Ward, which was bounded by Spruce Street on the north, South Street on the south, Sixth Street on the east, and Twenty-Third Street on the west. At that time, the Seventh Ward contained the largest population of Blacks in the city of Philadelphia. This map was published as part of the study”. Source: The University of Pennsylvania Archives.
Figure 13 - “An old-time midnight slave funeral.” This engraving demonstrates a typical slave funeral. Source: Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, Jean Blackwell Hutson Research and Reference Division, The New York Public Library.
Figure 14 - View of the African Creole Cemetery, Jodensavanne. Photo Credit: L. Leibman 2008.
Figure 15 - Unknown artist, A Congo chieftain’s grave, ca. 1830, West Central Africa. Source: Century Magazine, Vol. I.
Figure 16 - The Maerschalk plan of the City of New York is a historic map made in 1754 that clearly shows the African Burial Ground and its surrounding neighborhood. Source: National Park Service.
Figure 17 - Photo of the African Burial Ground in Lower Manhattan. Source: Aaris Atepa Architects.
Figure 18 – A jazz funeral procession for a deceased musician in New Orleans, Louisiana, circa 1965. The marching band traditionally plays slow dirges on the journey to the cemetery and upbeat melodies on the way back. Photo Credit: FPG/Archive Photos/ Getty Images.
Figure 19 - Map showing the locations of the various Philadelphia potter's field and almshouse cemeteries, circa 1715–1849. See full report for list of names. Mooney, Douglas and Kimberly Morrell. “Phase IB Archaeological Investigations of Mother Bethel Burying Ground, 1810–Circa 1864.” Prepared for Pennsylvania Horticultural Society, October 11, 2015.
Figure 21 - 1895 Map of Lebanon Cemetery. Source: Sanborn.
Figure 22 - 1895 Map of Olive Cemetery. Source: Sanborn.
Figure 23 - Map of the Borough of Collingdale. Although Mount Lebanon Cemetery is not shown on this map, it is a part of Collingdale which has been confirmed by numerous reports. Prepared by Pennsylvania Department of Transportation, Bureau of Planning and Research Geographic Information Division, 2010.
Figure 24 - Map of the Borough of Collingdale. This map accurately shows Mount Lebanon located in the Borough of Collingdale. Source: Mapwrapper, 2016.
Figure 25 - Map of Darby Borough (Collingsdale) 1892 The Bartram family farm owned by Thomas and Isaac are located between Springfield Road and Bartram Avenue next to Mount Zion. Source: Sanborn.
Figure 26 - Map of Land owned by Thomas Bartram before Eden purchase, 1892. Source: Philly Geo History.
Figure 27 - Map of Merion Cemetery in Bala Cynwyd, PA. Source: Philly GeoHistory.
Figure 28 - Eden Cemetery Company Charter, June 20th, 1902. Source: Eden Cemetery Company.
A STARTLING QUERY.

President Asbury Wants to Know if Collingdale Wants Dead Niggers or Live Ones.

"Which would you rather have—a dead nigger, or a live one?"

This was the final sentence of President Asbury in his peroration the other night in a speech before a town meeting of Collingdale citizens, relative to the location of the Eden Cemetery within the borough limits. It is believed this will clinch the matter in the company's favor.

The question was argued by Morton Z. Paul, the solicitor for the cemetery company.

President Asbury says if they cannot have the cemetery, they will sell the lots to colored people. He then asked his startling question.
Figure 30 - Photo of Celestine Cromwell’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 31 - Photo of John C. Asbury's headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 32 - Photo of Jerome Bacon’s grave. No headstone was dedicated to this grave.

Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 33 - Photo of Charles W. Jones’ cenotaph. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 34 - Photo of Martin J. Lehmann’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 35 - Photo of Daniel W. Parvis’ headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 36 - 1909 Map of Collingdale and Eden Cemetery. Source: Philly Geo History.
Figure 38 - Part of Ridley and Darby Townships, Aldan, Collingdale, and Glenolden, 1929. Source: Philly Geo History.
Figure 39 - Part of Upper Darby Twp. And Yeadon, Aldan, and Collingdale Boro., 1929. Source: Philly Geo History.
Perpetually Enshrined

Every man should give serious thought to the important duty of choosing a final resting place for departed loved ones.

EDEN Mausoleum was conceived to enable persons to honor the memory of deceased loved ones. It is built amid surroundings of unique grandeur and majestic beauty. It will ensure a need that the wisdom and judgment of this enlightened age have caused thoughtful people to desire.

We refer to above-ground interment of those who have passed on.

The first above-ground interment for Negroes in America, Eden Mausoleum is astonishingly beautiful. No similar mausoleum anywhere will better enable those who survive to perpetuate the hallowed memory of those who have gone never to return.

Built of granite, marble, and bronze, with outer walls about two feet thick, Eden Mausoleum will withstand the onslaught of wind, rain, and snow of the centuries. Like the Egyptian pyramids in Africa and Westminster Abbey in London, England, Eden Mausoleum will perpetually enshrine our loved ones.

EDEN MAUSOLEUM CORPORATION

Every man should give serious thought to the important duty of choosing a final resting place for departed loved ones.
Figure 41 - View of the current perimeter conditions at Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 42 - View of the current perimeter conditions at Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 43 - View of the administrative building from the Celestine Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 44 - View of the administrative building from the Katherine Parvis Gardens Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 45 - View of the administrative building from the Lincoln Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 46 - View of the administrative building from the Douglass D Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 47 - USGS Map of Eden Cemetery. Source: Lansdowne US Topo.
Figure 48 - Bench by the Road memorial. The Bench by the Road Project is a memorial history and community outreach initiative of the Toni Morrison Society. The goal of the project is to “to create an outdoor museum that will mark important locations in African American history both in the United States and abroad.” (Toni Morrison Society) Eden’s bench is the eleventh bench placed by this organization. Photo Credit: Author.
A BENCH BY THE ROAD

There is no place you or I can go, to think about or not think about, to summon the presences or, or recollect the absences of slaves; nothing that reminds us of the ones who made the journey and of those who did not make it. There is no suitable memorial or plaque or wreath or wall, or park or skyscraper lobby. There is no three-hundred-foot tower. There is no small bench by the road.

Toni Morrison 1989

The Bench by the Road Project was launched by the Toni Morrison Society in honor of Nobel Laureate Toni Morrison. This bench is placed in honor of Eden Cemetery, founded in 1802 in Collingdale, Pennsylvania, as a place to accommodate the thousands of remains from Philadelphia’s foremost African-American public, private, and parochial burial grounds, many of which were closed when public works projects disrupted their sites. John C. Asbury, an eminent African-American attorney, and one of Eden’s founders, had to fight a court to get an injunction ordered that would have halted the cemetery’s destruction. Through perseverance, determination, and a vision to create a meaningful resting place to venerate African-Americans, John Asbury, along with Jerome Bacon, Charles W. Wilson, Martin Lehmann, and Daniel C. Parvis, were among the first to see that goal come about.

Figure 49 - Bench by the Road memorial plaque. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 50 - Image of Catto “A” Lot Board. These are scanned images of the original lot boards used by the Eden Cemetery Company to keep track of the lots. According to Sheila Jones, there are a few mistakes that need to be corrected on these boards including the orientation of the lots and landscape features. Missing from this sequence are lot boards for the Douglass “A”, “B”, Daniel Parvis, Celestine Reserve, and Katherine Parvis Gardens Sections. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 51 - Image of Catto “B” Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 52 - Image of David Bowers Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 53 - Image of Lehmann Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 54 - Image of Richard Allen Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 55 - Image of Tubman Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 56 - Image of Bowers Lot Board. Note that Bowers is spelled incorrectly. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 57 - Image of Lebanon Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 58 - Image of Letson-Martin Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 59 - Image of John Brown Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 60 - Image of Douglass "B" Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 61 - Image of Douglass "C" Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 62 - Image of Lincoln Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 63 - Image of Home Lot Board. Note that there is no round-about path through Home as indicated. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 64 - Image of Olive Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 65 - Image of Celestine Lot Board. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 66 - View of the original gate posts from Lebanon Cemetery that have been disturbed and vandalized. According to Aaron Wunsch, the posts may have been the original entrance to Eden when Bartram Avenue was a major road between Mt. Zion and Eden. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 67 - Photo of disturbed headstones in Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 68 - Photo of disturbed headstones in Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 69 - Photo of disturbed headstones in Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 70 - Photo of disturbed headstones in Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 71 - Photo of disturbed headstones in Eden Cemetery. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 72 - Cemetery Company Map of the current sections of Eden Cemetery. Source: The Eden Cemetery Company.
Figure 73 - Photo of the Catto A Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 74 - Photo of the Catto A Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 75 - Photo of the Catto B Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 76 - Photo of the Catto B Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 77 - Photo of Catto’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 78 - Photo of the David Bowser Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 79 - Photo of the David Bowser Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 80 - Photo of the Lehmann Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 81 - Photo of the Lehman Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 82 - Photo of Julian Abele’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 83 - Photo of the Richard Allen Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 84 - Photo of the Richard Allen Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 85 - Photo of Arizona Cleaver Stemmons’ headstone (Front). Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 86 - Photo of Arizona Cleaver Stemmons’ headstone (Back). Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 87 - Photo of the Tubman Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 88 - Photo of the Tubman Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 89 - Photo of Robert Penn's headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 90 - Photo of the Bowers Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author. Note that Bowers is spelled incorrectly.
Figure 91 - Photo of the Bowers Section from the creek. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 92 - Photo of the Lebanon Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 93 - Photo of the Lebanon Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 95 - Photo of Absalom Jones’ cenotaph. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 97 - Photo of the Letson-Martin Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 98 - Photo of the Letson-Martin Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 99 - Photo of the John Brown Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 100 - Photo of the John Brown Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 102 - Photo of the Douglass “A” Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 103 - Photo of the Douglass “A” section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 104 - Photo of the Douglass “B” Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 105 - Photo of the Douglass “B” Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 106 - Photo of the Douglass “C” Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 107 - Photo of the Douglass “C” Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 108 - Photo of the Douglass “D” Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 109 - Photo of the Douglass “D” Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 110 - Photo of the Douglass “E” Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 111 - Photo of the Douglass “E” Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 112 - Photo of Tyrone Everett’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 113 - Photo of the Daniel Parvis Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 114 - Photo of the Daniel Parvis Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 115 - Photo of the Lincoln Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 116 - Photo of the Lincoln Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 117 - Photo of the Home Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 118 - Photo of the Home Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 119 - Photo of Stephen Smith’s headstone. Stephen Smith is buried in Celestine. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 120 - Photo of the Olive Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 121 - Photo of the Olive Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 122 - Photo of the Celestine Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 123 - Photo of the Celestine Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 124 - Photo of the Celestine Reserve #1 Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 125 - Photo of the Celestine Reserve #1 Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 126 - Photo of the Celestine Reserve #2 Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 127 - Photo of the Celestine Reserve #2 Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 128 - Photo of Reginald Bryant’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 129 - Photo of George Henry White’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 130 - Photo of Charles Tindley's headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 131 - Photo of Christopher Perry’s headstone. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 133 - Photo of the Katherine Parvis Gardens Section Marker. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 134 - Photo of the Katherine Parvis Gardens Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 135 - View of the creek in between Richard Allen and Bowers Sections (Close-up). Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 136 - View of the creek next to Bowers Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 137 - View of creek by the Letson-Martin Section. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 138 - View of creek by the Letson-Martin Section (Mouth). Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 139 - View of creek next to Letson-Martin Section (Side). Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 140 - View of the receiving vault (From the main path). Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 141 - View of the receiving vault (Front). Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 142 - View of the receiving vault (Side next to John Brown Section). Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 143 - View of the receiving vault (Side). Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 144 - Interior of the receiving vault. Photo Credit: Author.
Figure 145 - 1919 Monument to African-American soldiers who served during World War 1, located next to the gate entrance, in front of the Katherine Parvis Gardens Section. The inscription on the monument reads: “In memoriam, the colored soldiers of Pennsylvania who fought and died in France 1917-1918 that Liberty, Equality, and Fraternity might be established between all nations and among all peoples. Erected by the memorial committee May 30th, 1919. Photo Credit: Author.
Appendix 2 Maps of African-American Burial Site Displacement in Philadelphia

The attached documents illustrate the displacement of African-American burials in Philadelphia from the seventh century to the beginning of the twentieth century with the founding of Eden. The significance of these documents is to help visualize the issue African-Americans faced when their places of burial were condemned by the city. Although numerous burial sites, including white burial sites, were condemned by the city, most of the burial sites serving the white community were relocated to numerous places outside of the city. African-American burial sites in Philadelphia did not have this option, which became the reason for Eden’s significance. Eden became the literal and figurative collection site of African-American burial landscapes.
Eighteenth century enslaved blacks living in Philadelphia were buried in the black only sections of the potter's field due to the availability burying land within the city limits. Most examples of this burial type are difficult to search for, let alone preserve because of their past destruction and difficulties of detection. Another example of this burial type in Philadelphia was the Negroes' section of the Stranger's' Burying Ground, a potter's field, renamed Washington Square in 1825, located near 7th and Walnut Streets. This site was converted into the Weccacoe Playground in 1910 by the Philadelphia Department of Recreation. All of the known potter's fields in Philadelphia have been demolished.
Churchyards were established after Emancipation and with the creation of formal African-American national churches. In the urban center of Philadelphia in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, churchyards were bounded by residential and commercial housing. Also in black churchyards, families were loosely grouped and the placement of individual graves within these groupings had no distinguishable order. Often in archaeological investigations, these groupings appear to be irregular and “strongly individualistic.” African-Americans used handcrafted headstones often made out of perishable materials, which accounts for the non-existence of many grave markers. In the 1800s, a significant number of the African-American owned...
churchyards were disbanded and the graves re-located to larger nonsectarian cemeteries near the edge of the city.
Larger public cemeteries were founded in 1849 for African-Americans who were excluded from other rural cemetery companies. Many of the African-American churchyards in the city were relocated to the two African-American cemeteries, Olive and Lebanon. However, these cemeteries fell into disrepair and were eventually condemned due to improvements in sanitary im-
improvements. In 1889, Lebanon was condemned and in 1902 the property was sold and all of the graves were reinterred in Eden Cemetery. In 1903, Olive was condemned and in 1923, most of the graves were relocated to Eden as well. Smaller nonsectarian cemeteries such as Stephen Smith Home Burial Ground were also closed and the graves reinterred in Eden.
At the turn of the century, a group of black leaders gathered together to design a final resting place for African-Americans living in the Philadelphia as well as the final resting place for those who had been buried in the abandoned segregated cemeteries. Eden Cemetery is a suburban cemetery located in a borough next to the urban center, but not threatened by the city limits, as were Lebanon...
and Olive. Eden is an example of African-Americans adopting the “lawn park” in rural cemetery design and tradition, and is a “collector cemetery” for older condemned African-American burial sites.
Index

Abele, Julien ........................................................................................................... xi, 63
African Burial Ground in Manhattan ................................................................... xi, 63
African Episcopal Church of St. Thomas .............................................................. 22, 29, 32, 63
African Methodist Episcopal (A.M.E) Church .................................................... 22
Allen, Richard ...................................................................................................... ix, xi, xiii, 22, 24, 32, 33, 45, 63, 79, 80
Anderson, Marian ................................................................................................ v
Asbury, John C. .................................................................................................... viii, 36, 41, 43, 44, 45, 46, 49, 63, 64, 65, 73, 74, 75
Bacon, Jerome ...................................................................................................... viii, 34, 36, 40, 41, 45, 46, 49, 53, 65, 69
Bartram ................................................................................................................ vii, x, 39, 41, 42, 44, 51, 59, 80
"Bench by the Road" ........................................................................................... ix, 58
Benn of Cadingdale v Eden Cemetery Company, 1902 ....................................... 43
Bowser, David ..................................................................................................... 62
Bryant, Reginald .................................................................................................. 65
Catto, Octavius V. ............................................................................................... ix, x, 62, 63, 68
"colored meeting camp" ...................................................................................... 42
Cromwell, Celestine ............................................................................................. viii, 36, 44, 50, 65
Parvis, Daniel W. ............................................................................................... viii, 36, 42, 45, 47, 64
de facto segregation ............................................................................................ 24, 27, 69
de jure segregation ............................................................................................... 24, 27, 69
displacement ........................................................................................................ iv, 28, 82
Dubois, W.E.B. .................................................................................................. v, 24, 34, 38, 40, 46, 71, 79
Eden Cemetery .................................................................................................... iii, iv, v, viii, ix, x, 15, 16, 17, 18, 21, 28, 34, 36, 37, 38, 39, 41, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, 47, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 53, 54, 55, 56, 57, 58, 61, 66, 67, 68, 70, 73, 74, 75
Eden Mausoleum Corporation .......................................................................... 51, 71
ethnographic landscape ..................................................................................... xii, 64
Everett, Tyrone .................................................................................................. 58
Friends of Eden Cemetery ............................................................................... 58
"Hallowed Grounds" ......................................................................................... 58
Har Zion Cemetery ............................................................................................ 39, 48
Harper, Frances Ellen Watkins ........................................................................... xi, 64
Herskovits-Frazier Debate ................................................................................. 20, 61
historic vernacular landscape ......................................................................... 59
Jones, Absalom .................................................................................................. xi, 22, 32, 33, 63
Jones, Charles W. .............................................................................................. viii, 36, 42, 45, 46
Laurel Hill Cemetery ........................................................................................ 22, 35
lawn-park cemeteries ........................................................................................ v, 18, 35, 37, 38, 48, 49, 50, 51, 58, 60, 62, 65, 68
Lebanon Cemetery ............................................................................................. v, vii, x, 20, 27, 30, 34, 35, 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 44, 48, 49, 50, 55, 57, 62, 63, 69, 70, 71
Lehmann, Martin J. ............................................................................................ viii, ix, xi, 36, 42, 45, 47, 49, 63, 74
Letson, Albert .................................................................................................. 64
Martin, Maximillian ............................................................................................. 64
Montier, Elizabeth and Hiram ............................................................................ xi, 63
Mount Lebanon Cemetery ................................................................................... vii, 39, 48
Mount Zion Meeting Cemetery ........................................................................ vii, x, 34, 38, 39, 41, 44, 48, 51, 58, 65, 75